श्री एस॰एस॰ अहलुवालिया (झारखंड): हमारी बात को पहले सुना जाए। ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री उपसभापति: सबकी बात सुनेंगे। ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री एस॰एस॰ अहलुवालिया: नोटिस कैसे है? ...(व्यवधान)... हमारी बात को पहले सुना जाए।...(व्यवधान)...

श्री उपसभापति: उनका भी नोटिस है, आपका भी नोटिस है।...(व्यवधान)...

श्री एस॰एस॰ अहलुवालिया: हमारा नोटिस ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री उपसभापति: आप जब बोलेंगे ...(व्यवधान)... वेंकैया नायडु जी, जब आप बोलें तब अपनी बात कहिएगा... (व्यवधान)...हाउस इस तरह से नहीं चलेगा।...(व्यवधान)...हाउस ऐसे नहीं चलेगा।...(व्यवधान)...आप बैठिए।... (व्यवधान)... हाउस एग्रीमेंट से चलेगा। प्लीज बैठिए।... (व्यवधान)...

प्रो॰ राम देव भंडारी: (बिहार): इन्हें कॉफीडेंस सिस्टम में विश्वास नहीं है।...(व्यवधान)...

श्री उपसभापति: आप बैठिए।...(व्यवधान)... अहलुवालिया जी, आपको मौका दिया जाएगा।...(व्यवधान)... Ahluwaliaji, you are the Whip of the Party. ...(*Interruptions*)... आप बैठिए।

श्री एस.एस. अहलुवालिया: उपसभापति महोदय ...(व्यवधान)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I request all the hon. Members to ...(*Interruptions*)... If you are serious...(*Interruptions*)... You see, all this has been agreed...(*Interruptions*)... Mr. Suresh Pachouri to lay on the Table. ...(*Interruptions*)...

PAPERS LAID ON THE TABLE—Contd.

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PERSONNEL, PUBLIC GRIEVANCES AND MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS (SHRI SURESH PACHOURI): Sir, on behalf of my colleague, Dr. Shakeel Ahmad, I beg to lay on the Table, under clause (1) of article 151 of the Constitution a copy (in English and Hindi) of the Report of the Comptroller and Auditor General of India for the year ended 31st March, 2007 (No. CA 12 of 2008) on the Union Government (Commercial)-Public Sector Undertakings in Telecommunications Sector-Compliance Audit Observations.

[Placed in Library. *See* No. L.T. 8164/08]

MATTER RAISED WITH PERMISSION—Contd.

Attack on CPI(M) Office

श्री उपसभापति: आप बैठिए। ...(व्यवधान)... अहलुवालिया जी, आपको opportunity मिलेगी। ...(व्यवधान)... आपको opportunity मिलेगी। ...(व्यवधान)... आप तशरीफ रखिए। ...(व्यवधान)...यह ऐग्रीमेंट हुआ है। ...(व्यवधान)... यहां पर चैंबर में यह ऐग्रीमेंट हुआ है ...(व्यवधान)... आप वापस जाइए ...(व्यवधान)... भंडारी जी, आप जाइये। आप जाइये। ...(व्यवधान)... भंडारी जी, आप वापिस जाइये।...(व्यवधान)...आप जाइये। आप वापिस जाइये। ...(व्यवधान)...देखिए, आप वापिस जाइये। ...(व्यवधान)...Please go to your seat. ...(*Interruptions*)... आप जाइये। आप जाइये। आप बोलिए। ...(व्यवधान)... Please go to your seat.

...(Interruptions)... आप वापिस जाइये। आप अपनी सीट से बोलिए। ...(व्यवधान)...पाणि जी, आप जाइये ...(व्यवधान)...Please go to your seat. ...*(Interruptions)*... आप जाइये। आप बोलिए। आप जाइये। ...(व्यवधान)...आप वापिस जाइये। देखिए, चैम्बर में यह डिसकस हुआ है। ...(व्यवधान)...Please go to your seat. ...*(Interruptions)*... आप जाइये।

प्लीज, आप वापिस जाइये। ...(व्यवधान)... क्या आप डिसकस नहीं करना चाहते हैं? आप वापिस जाइये। ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री एस॰एस॰ अहलुवालिया: उपसभापति महोदय, ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री उपसभापति: आप वापिस जाइये। ...(व्यवधान)... Noting will go on record ...*(Interruptions)*... आप वापिस जाइये। ...(व्यवधान)... पाणि जी, आप वापिस जाइये। ...(व्यवधान)... आप वापिस जाइये। ...(व्यवधान)... Noting will go on record ...*(Interruptions)*... अहलुवालिया जी, ...(व्यवधान)... आप वापिस जाइये। ...(व्यवधान)... आप जो कुछ कहना चाहते हैं, वह अपनी सीट से कहिए। ...(व्यवधान)... आप जो कुछ कहना चाहते हैं, वह अपनी सीट से कहिए। ...(व्यवधान).... आप अपनी सीट पर वापिस जाइये। ...(व्यवधान)... Noting will go on record ...*(Interruptions)*... आप वापिस जाइये। आप वापिस जाइये। ...(व्यवधान)... The House is adjourned for half an hour.

The House then adjourned at ten minutes past twelve of the clock.

The House reassembled at thirty-nine minutes past twelve of the clock

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN in the Chair

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Shri Sitaram Yechury.

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, I rise here with a sense of anger, anguish and agony about the way the party office, the central committee office of the Communist Party of India (Marxist) was attacked yesterday and the manner in which it was publicly declared by the RSS and its affiliated organisations that they have conducted this attack. Former MLAs of the BJP and six Councillors have been arrested. We consider this sort of an attack not merely an attack against our party and against what we represent, but this is a general assault on democracy, and, therefore, it needs to be condemned by all who believe in democracy. Sir, it is, again, not confined only to this attack on our office here; last night, the house of the Secretary of our Karnataka unit was attacked and ransacked in Bangalore and it was publicly declared that RSS was doing this. So, this ia a widespread attack of terror that is being unleashed by the RSS and its affiliates, and this only reminds me of the sort of atmosphere that was created 60 years ago in the country. Because of that atmosphere, the life of the Mahatma was consumed by these forces...*(Interruptions)*...and it is a similar type of* intolerance that is being spread in our country today, and this completely antithetical to democracy. So, we today state very clearly that this is something which is not acceptable in a democracy and these forces, who had taken such action, will have to subscribe to the democratic principles.

*Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

sir, the authorities must take complete and full cognisance of the issue and take action against those who have conducted this sort of an attack. Sir, the hon. Home Minister is present here, and we would like an assurance from him, a statement from him that action will be taken against people who have conducted this attack on our Office and damaged the property. We would also like to know what has happened so far in this regard. We would like the hon. Home Minister to inform the House on this issue. Often, the excuse that has been used is that some developments have happened in Kerala and because of that, this attack was conducted on our office here. For the last six months, the CPI(M) has lost ten of its people in Kerala in attacks by RSS and our cadre have been brutally killed. And, we understand why this sort of an attack is happening. In Kerala, in Bengal, in Tripura, where we are there, they have not won even a single Assembly seat. So, we understand the frustration that comes from this. But, this cannot be an excuse for the manner of such violence that is directed against us. This is also a fact that the number of RSS *shakhas* is declining in Kerala and because of that frustration, they are attacking the CPI(M) there. I understand, they are saying that it is a law and order problem of the State, and at the State level, they are settling this there. That we can understand. But, why and how can you use that as an excuse to come again and do such vandalism in Delhi? Can this be permitted in our parliamentary democracy, in the Capital, Delhi, the Headquarters of a national party is vandalised and attacked? Why could the Police not alert their personnel? We would like the Home Minister to clarify to us that why the necessary response of the Police and action by them was not taken at the right time. He will, of course, answer that. But, it is this ideology of* intolerance that cannot be tolerated in our democracy. That is why, we would like to use this opportunity also to once again re-assert the fact that in the evolution of Indian polity, there have been three streams that have developed. One, of course, was the mainstream of the national movement which was led by the Congress which talked of creating a secular democratic Republic. We had the Left vision of taking the forward beyond a secular democratic Republic into the economic emancipation of every individual. But, then, you had the third vision which was the complete antithesis of these visions and which had a twin expression. You had a twin expression of defining India on the basis of the religious affiliations of its people. One expression was of the Muslim League and that was the theory which led to very unfortunate, and, I think, the most agonising partition of our country and the other was that of the RSS which talks in terms of creating a *Hindu Rashtra.* That is completely antithetical to the secular democratic foundations that we have and which are ascribed in our Constitution. So, we, today, once again, reasert the fact that it is this Constitution; it is this secular democratic values, on the basis of which modern Indian Republic has been founded, that has to be safeguarded and this sort of an attack that happened there on the 9th March on our office is something that actually goes against the fundamental basis that is enshrined in our Constitution. What actually has happened there last night? We were having our Central Committee meeting, and we had people coming there with cars loaded with stones, stopping there and immediately started stoning. Sir, today morning, hon. Chairman asked me the reason for being late

*Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

for the Leaders' meeting, I told him that my car had been damaged and I had to come in a private vehicle — thanks to them —and, therefore, I was a little late. Sir, this is something which we cannot accept, and, this is something on which we want the present Government — which has come into office on the basis of upholding secularism agaisnt communal forces — to tell us how they are going to take action against these forces, which, as I said, is not confined to only one attack in Delhi. This is an attack that is being planned all across the country. This is something that will have a very destablising effect and this is something that cannot be tolerated.

So, therefore, I also want the Government to give us the assurance in this regard. At other places, wherever such attacks are happening, let them consult the State Governments and, in accordance with that, let a firm action be taken against these forces thereby giving a message that such vandalism cannot be tolerated.

So, I would appeal to you, Sir, let this House universally condemn this attack, out rightly condemn this attack, and, let this House also universally declare that these sorts of attacks are not attacks against any one political party, but that is an attack against democracy as a whole, and, therefore, this cannot be accepted and this will be completely condemned and, Sir, this is my appeal to the House.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Mr. Deputy Chairman, Sir, I was closely and seriously hearing the speech of our colleague from the CPM and I expected him to do some introspection and then speak frankly. But, unfortunately, he started politicising the entire issue and started preaching us ideological sermons. Sir, we are proud, we are a nationalist party, we are a national party and we feel India is one country where there should be no discrimination on the basis of religion, caste or creed. It is these people who aligned with Muslim League, formed Government a number of times, and, even now, they are having one alliance in Kerala with one group of Muslim League and contesting elections ....(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, this is a distortion..:(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, this is their tolerance. ...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Okey. You can clarify later. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, this is their tolerance level. ...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please sit down. ...(*Interruptions*)... Please allow him to speak. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, this is the tolerance they have ...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: all right, please take your seat. ...(*Interruptions*)... You can clarify later. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI PENUMALLI MADHU (Andhra Pradesh): Sir, this is not ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: I am ready to be corrected ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI DIGVIJAY SINGH (Jharkhand): Sir, they are saying ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, I said, I am ready to be corrected...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Digvijay Singhji, please sit down...(Interruptions)...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, this is the first time, in this history of this country, when a party, which is responsible for the partition of the country, that party's nominee is a Minister in this Government, supported ably by this party. ...(*Interruptions*)... He is giving us sermons; he is preaching sermons, surprisingly. Sir, this is a party...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI A. VIJAYARAGHAVAN (Kerala): Sir, this is something which ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, this is a party ...(*Interruptions*)... सर, ऐसा तो नहीं चलेगा ...(व्यवधान)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please speak ...(*Interruptions*)... You see, they have listened to you, now you listen to them. This was the agreement. ...(*Interruptions*)... If you have any clarification, ask it later on. ...(*Interruptions*)... It has been agreed, you will speak and they will listen, and, then, they will sepak and you will listen.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, firstly, nobody will be happy with attacks and counter attacks. I do agree that the Constitution should prevail; the rule of law should prevail. The Central Government and the State Government— the Delhi Government or the Government in Knnur— should take care of the life and property of the people, and, they must give an opportunity to political rivals with different ideologies also to function smoothly. The entire country has witnessed what has happened in West Bengal, in Nandigram. I do not want to explain it any further. Everybody knows it. ...(*Interruptions*)... Sir, today ...(*Interruptions*)...

श्री उपसभापति: उनको बोलने दीजिए ...(व्यवधान)... उनको बोलने दीजिए ...(व्यवधान)... No, no. He will tell us his view ...(*Interruptions*)... Why are you worried?

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: He is saying, we cannot hear the views. ...(*Interruptions*)... That is the tolerance level. ...(*Interruptions*)... This is * terrorism. ...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let him say whatever he wants to say. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, what is happening in Kerala is contrary to what my friend has said. Day-by-day, some of the cadres of CPM are deserting the party and are joining the BJP, the RSS... *(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please ... *(Interruptions)*... Please ... *(Interruptions)*... You should develop the temper to listen. ... *(Interruptions)*... Please ... *(Interruptions)*... No, no, Mr. Vijayaraghavan, he will not apprise you. ... *(Interruptions)*...You must know ... *(Interruptions)*... Mr. Vijayaraghavan, do you expect that Mr. Venkaiah Naidu will apprise you? ... *(Interruptions)*... If you expect ... *(Interruptions)*...

*Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

श्री एम॰ वेंकैया नायडु: मेरी इस पार्टी को किसी सर्टिफिकेट की जरूरत नहीं है। हमारी पार्टी अंडमान में जीती, नागालैंड में जीती, मेघालय में जीती, गुजरात में जीती, पंजाब में जीती, हिमाचल में जीती, उत्तरांचल में जीती ...(**व्यवधान**)। आप उन सभी इलाकों में कहां हैं ...(**व्यवधान**) नहीं, नहीं, आप इसमें मत पड़ो। I do agree that we did not win a seat in Bengal or Kerala or Tripura. I do agree. But, at the same time, you say that you are the champion of the so-called workers, where are you in the entire Hindi heartland? Where are you even in Gujarat? Where are you in other States? So, let us not enter into that debate. We can have it separately outside. ...*(Interruptions)*... So, that is not a part of the country ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Madhu ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: That is not a part of the country. ...*(Interruptions)*... Even in Arunachal, we have two MPs. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please address me. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री एम॰ वेंकैया नायडु: कभी-कभी हारना जीतना होता रहता है, सीताराम जी, लास्ट टाइम भी बंगाल से हमारे एमपीज़ थे, यह जानकारी आपको भी है ...(**व्यवधान**)। इसलिए कभी आप हारते हैं, कभी हम हारते हैं, लेकिन फर्क इतना ही है कि आप ज्यादा हारते हैं।

श्री उपसभापति: नहीं, नहीं ...(**व्यवधान**)।

श्री सीताराम येचुरी: मैं बिल्कुल आपकी बात मानता हूं। चुनावों में हारना या जीतना तो होता ही है, लेकिन जो हारते हैं, वह इस तरीके से हिंसा के रूप में प्रकट न हो, यही बात है।

श्री वैंकैया नायडु: यह सही है, सर। I do agree that the people who are in power, the people who are ruling, they must have greater patience. They must allow some space for the Opposition to work. What is happening in Kerala? If you go to history, ask anybody, including your friends in Congress, yesterday the Congress President sat on *dharna.* The State Congress President of Kerala sat on *dharna.* What for? Demanding Central forces to be sent to Kerala. Mr. Ramesh Chennithala — "Deployment of Central forces to the violence in Kannur. Kodiyeri should quit".* is the Home Minister of that State. That is the situation one can understand. Mr. Oommen Chandy sat on *dharna.* Is it not a fact? We just want to clarify. Mr. Oommen Chandy sat on *dharna.* Mr. Ramesh Chennithala demands for deployment of Central forces. You can imagine the situation. The Muslim League says, the AIML says that it is blackmail. And, the other parties who were earlier friends of the CPM are also distancing themselves. Sir, day before yesterday, I went to Kerala. I went to ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI K. CHANDRAN PILLAI: (Kerala): Sir, we must ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please ...*(Interruptions)*... Please, sit down. ...*(Interruptions)*... Let him say. ...*(Interruptions)*... Please, sit down ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI TAPAN KUMAR SEN (West Bengal): Sir, whether that can be justified ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, no ...*(Interruptions)*... It has been agreed ...*(Interruptions)*... Please, don't intervene ...*(Interruptions)*... Please, sit down. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Don't justify stoning and counter-throwing from below and from up also. Number of workers ...*(Interruptions)*...

*Not recorded.

SHRI A. VIJAYARAGHAVAN: Sir, as a matter of ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Vijayaraghavan ...*(Interruptions)*... He referred to what. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI A. VIJAYARAGHAVAN: He has referred to the name ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I will remove that ...*(Interruptions)*... That name will be removed from the records. ...*(Interruptions)*... Please don't refer to the names who cannot defend here.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, I did not make any allegation. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, no, but names should not be taken. ...*(Interruptions)*... You can say 'Home Minister'. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री राशिद अल्वी (आन्ध्र प्रदेश): महोदय ...(**व्यवधान**)।

श्री रुद्रनारायण पाणि (उड़ीसा): सर, ...(**व्यवधान**)।

श्री उपसभापति: प्लीज, आप बैठिए, आप बैठिए ...(**व्यवधान**)। ऑलरेडी बहुत से लोग इंटरवीन कर रहे हैं, अल्वी जी, आप बैठिए। पाणि जी, आप भी बैठिए ...(**व्यवधान**)।

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, day before yesterday, I was in Kerala. I was taken to a hospital, which is a local missionary hospital. It is one of the famous ophthalmology hospitals in the State of Kerala, situated in the outskirts of Kochi. Mr. K.S. Sanoop, he is the college union president of the Sree Krishna Degree College in the area of Guruvayur. He won the elections. He was writing the examination. Their supporters entered the class room and they cut his leg. ...*(Interruptions)*... Sir, the boy is in hospital even today. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI A. VIJAYARAGHAVAN: Sir, I can quote 100 incidents. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Vijayaraghavan. ...*(Interruptions)*... Should I decide what he is saying is wrong? I don't have the facts. ...*(Interruptions)*... No, no. ...*(Interruptions)*... You see, whatever Mr. Venkaiah Naidu wants to say, he will say. Whatever you want to say, you will say. This is a debate. For everything, you object. ...*(Interruptions)*... Please listen. ...*(Interruptions)*... Please have patience. ...*(Interruptions)*... Mr. Vijayaraghavan. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI A. VIJAYARAGHAVAN: Sir, communal violence ...*(Interruptions)*... That is my concern. ...*(Interruptions)*... He is instigating. ...*(Interruptions)*...

प्रो॰ राम देव भंडारी (बिहार): सर, ...(**व्यवधान**)... ये वही लोग हैं ...(**व्यवधान**)...

श्री उपसभापति: भंडारी जी, ...(**व्यवधान**)... आप भी बोल रहे हैं न? ...(**व्यवधान**)... आप भी बोल रहे हैं ... (**व्यवधान**)... आपकी भी पार्टी का नाम है। ...(**व्यवधान**)..

श्री रुद्रनारायण पाणि: पहले हिंसा भड़काने वाले लोग हैं ...(**व्यवधान**)...

श्री उपसभापति: नहीं, आप बैठिए। ...(**व्यवधान**)... पाणि जी, आपके लीडर बोल रहे हैं। आप खामोश नहीं बैठ सकते?

श्री एम॰ वेंकैया नायडु: इसमें कम्युनलिज़्म कहाँ से आया? ...(**व्यवधान**)... सर, ऐसे ही इस देश के पोलिटिक्स को विषाक्त करने की स्थिति इन लोगों ने पैदा की। हरेक विषय में कम्युनलिज़्म लाना। K.S. Sanoop, College Union

President, was attacked brutally. His leg is broken and the chief of the hospital has told me that there is no possibility of the boy getting vision. So, one eye has gone. And as I am explaining it, my hon. friends say that I am trying to communalise the situation in Kerala. Where is communalism in this ? I don't understand that. In the last few days, and particularly in the last one week, six RSS and BJP workers have been murdered, their hands were cut. Sir, it is a horrible situation. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, what are we discussing? What is the topic of discussion? ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please, please. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI A. VIJAYARAGHAVAN: Sir, if these kinds of comments are coming, you please give me a chance, I want to respond to these issues.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I will give you a chance. ...*(Interruptions)*... I will you a chance. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, I have a point of order. Sir, you allowed a discussion on a specific topic. Are we going to discuss that topic of the attack on the CPM office or are we going to discuss anything else? ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री कलराज मिश्र (उत्तर प्रदेश): सर, सीताराम येचुरी जी बोल रहे थे कि ...(**व्यवधान**)... सर, सीताराम येचुरी जी बोल रहे थे कि कि गांधी के हत्यारे और ये सारी families ...(**व्यवधान**)...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, what are we discussing? We want a clarification.

श्री उपसभापति: आप बैठिए न? ...(**व्यवधान**)... आप बैठिए ...(**व्यवधान**)... देखिए, आप पोस्टर मत दिखाइए प्लीज। ...(**व्यवधान**)...

श्री मुख्तार अब्बास नकवी (उत्तर प्रदेश): यह क्या तरीका है? ...(**व्यवधान**)... यह क्या तरीका है? ...(**व्यवधान**)...

SHRI A. VIJAYARAGHAVAN: Sir, this is not the way. This is violation of the Code of Conduct. This House runs according to the rule books. He is violating. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I have told him not to show the poster. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, we have utmost respect for the Chair. When the Chair was standing, I have to stand up and ask for my chance. I also feel guilty in my heart that I should not do it. But, at the same time, I also know as to what is going to happen. That is why, I told my sister, our Deputy Leader, that if they are going to hear us, I have no objection to hear Shri Sitaram Yechury. He is a senior member of his party. There is no problem. The point is that they have a habit to explain their viewpoint, but, they don't allow others. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Vijayaraghavan, please. ...*(Interruptions)*... Let me speak. No, no, please ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Is this the way democracy functions? ...*(Interruptions)*... क्या यह सब्जैक्ट नहीं है? ...(**व्यवधान**)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Vijayaraghavan, I am on my legs. Will you allow me to speak? ...*(Interruptions)*... Shahid Siddiquiji, please. ...*(Interruptions)*... See, this House functions as per rules. Now, the notice is on the attack on CPM Office at Delhi which subject

concerns the Union Home Ministry. So, that is why, this has been admitted. This has been discussed. Now, you have a point. But, the question is that law and order is a State subject.

1.00 P.M.

We have to work within that. Incidentally, you can mention. If you want the Government to respond, how can the Government respond like this?

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, the Government has to respond. Even the Union Home Minister is sitting here. He has got a right. He has a responsibility towards the lives of the people in Kerala. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please, Mr. Vijayaraghavan. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI A. VIJAYARAGHAVAN: Sir, we have a Constitution and a rule book. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री उपसभापति: आप बोलिए न, आप बोलिए। ...(**व्यवधान**)... आप बोलिए।

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, our notice is very clear. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, I want to seek a clarification. ...*(Interruptions)*... Mr. Venkaiah Naidu, yield for one second. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, the notice is about Kerala also.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, no, no.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: The notice is about Kerala also.

SHRI A. VIJAYARAGHAVAN: Let me assure, Mr. Naidu, ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, see the notice first. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I have read the notice. ...*(Interruptions)*... I have read the notice. ...*(Interruptions)*... आप बोलिए। ...(**व्यवधान**)... I have read the notice. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI A. VIJAYARAGHAVAN: Sir, he should confine himself to the topic of the discussion. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: How can you discuss Gujarat here? ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री सीताराम येचुरी: अरे भाई, सुनिए न। हम आपको सुनेंगे ...(**व्यवधान**)... हम आपको सुनेंगे, हम आपको सुनने के लिए तैयार हैं।

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: How can you discuss Gujarat here? How can they discuss the December ...*(Interruptions)*... When it comes to BJP and India, you say it is a State subject; you don't want to discuss! ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Let me assure you, Mr. Venkaiah Nadu, that we will listen to you. But please confine yourself to the subject of discussion. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI MUKHTAR ABBAS NAQVI: Sir, ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please don't show that. ...*(Interruptions)*... Please don't show that. Please follow certain principles. ...*(Interruptions)*... Please don't show it here.

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: Let us see the truth. ...*(Interruptions)*... Let us see the truth. ...*(Interruptions)*...

प्रो॰ राम देव भंडारी: आप इश्यू पर बोलिए, इश्यू से बाहर जा रहे हैं। हम लोग भी बाहर जाएंगे।

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, one year back, in the same State, one of my colleagues who was a Yuva Morcha State Vice-President, K.D. Jayakrishnan, he was teaching in a class. ...*(Interruptions)*... People went to the class. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI A. VIJAYARAGHAVAN: What is happening, Sir? ...*(Interruptions)*... When did this happen? ...*(Interruptions)*... What is this, Sir? ...*(Interruptions)*... What is going on, Sir? ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, no, no. Mr. Venkaiah Naidu. please listen ...*(Interruptions)*... देखिए, यह मत दिखाइए। I am saying. ...*(Interruptions)*... नो-नो; आप मत दिखाइए ...(व्यवधान)... नकवी साहब, पोस्टर मत दिखाइए। ...(व्यवधान)...

SHRI A. VIJAYARAGHAVAN:*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, no, no. Nothing will go on record. ...*(Interruptions)*... Nothing will go on record except Mr. Venkaiah Nadu. ...*(Interruptions)*... Except Mr. Venkaiah Nadu, nothing will go on record.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, yesterday ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: See, you can also make a passing reference as Mr. Yechury has made a passing reference. But, in detail, it is very difficult. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, yesterday, in the same State, In the Haji Court, my Party office was burnt ...*(Interruptions)*... and the people attacked my office. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI A. VIJAYARAGHAVAN:*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: In this way, we cannot carry on. ...*(Interruptions)*... Nobody looks to be serious. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: People attacked my office. ...*(Interruptions)*... Sir, I have a police report. ...*(Interruptions)*... All newspapers were carrying a report in Kerala that BJP office was burnt; furniture was broken; T.V. sets were broken. ...(*Interruptions*)... And these people say ...(*Interruptions*)... Sir, Mr. Sitaram Yechury is concerned about his car and the Congressmen are concerned about *Sarkar!* ...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, no; Mr. Venkaiah Naidu, this is not the way ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: What about the Haji ...(*Interruptions*)... You are not concerned. ...(*Interruptions*)... You are not concerned; you are not worried. ...(*Interruptions*)...

MR.DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Venkaiah Naidu, please don't do that. ...(*Interruptions*)... I have said ...(*Interruptions*)... You see ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: I don't understand ...(*Interruptions*)... I don't understand ...(*Interruptions*)... Sir, I have a right to work in this country. ...(*Interruptions*)...

MR DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: It has been the right of everybody. ...(*Interruptions*)...

---

*Not recorded.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: This is not ...(*Interruptions*)... It is not a stand against terror ...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I think it looks that nobody is interested. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, we are all concerned. We are all people who believe in Constitution. They don't believe....(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI A. VIJAYARAGHAVAN: *

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: He is not yielding. What can I do? ...(*Interruptions*)... I have called him ...(*Interruptions*)... Mr. Vijayaraghavan, you know that when Mr. Sitaram Yechury got up, he yielded. But he is not yielding to you. What can I do?

SHRI A. VIJAYARAGHAVAN: ...(*Interruptions*)...

MR M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Yes, we are concerned. Sir, my party office was attacked ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: *

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I can only appeal. ...(*Interruptions*)... Please listen to him ...(*Interruptions*)... Please sit down. ...(*Interruptions*)... Please sit down.

SHRI DIGVIJAY SINGH: *

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I am asking ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI DIGVIJAY SINGH: *

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Digvijay Singh, I am asking everybody to sit down. What are you saying? ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI DIGVIJAY SINGH: *

श्री उपसभापतिः आप क्या बात कर रहे हैं।

SHRI DIGVIJAY SINGH: *

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Don't interrupt. ...(*Interruptions*)... Please, you are a senior Member. I don't expect that from you. ...(*Interruptions*)... I don't expect that you will ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI DIGVIJAY SINGH *

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I don't expect that you will ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI DIGVIJAY SINGH: *

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, no; if you say this. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI DIGVIJAY SINGH: *

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I have been appealing. ...(*Interruptions*)... Am I not asking to stop? ...(*Interruptions*)... I am asking you to listen. You are not listening. He is also not listening. What is it that the Chair can do? ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY (Puducherry): *

*Not recorded.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please sit down. ...(*Interruptions*)... Whenever it is convenient to you, it is all right for you. Whenever it is convenient to them,it is all right for them. ...(*Interruptions*)... You can break all the rules and put the burden on the Chair. (*Interruptions*)... Please. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI D. RAJA (Tamil Nadu): Sir, I am asking. ...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Raja, he is not yielding. (*Interruptions*)... I have not called you. (*Interruptions*)... I have not called you. (*Interruptions*)... He is not yielding. (*Interruptions*)... Please (*Interruptions*)... When your turn come you can speak. (*Interruptions*)... Your name is there. (*Interruptions*)... Your name is there. (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI A. VIJAYARAGHAVAN: How can you go on like this? (*Interruptions*)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I have called him. He has to speak. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI D.RAJA: Sir, I am raising a point of order.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: What is your point of order? (*Interruptions*)... Under what rule are you raising it? (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: Under what rule are you raising the point of order? (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI D. RAJA: I want the Chair to clarify one simple thing. (*Interruptions*)... I want the Chair to clarify one simple thing. (*Interruptions*)... Are we discussing the attack on the CPM office in Delhi or the law and order situation in Kerala? You please clarify. (*Interruptions*)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Just one minute. (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, Kerala is God's own country. (*Interruptions*)... It is passing through. (*Interruptions*)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Naidu, just one minute. He has asked for a clarification. This notice is on the attack on the CPM office in Delhi. It relates to a subject which is under the Centre. Now, on the Kerala issue you can make a passing reference, but there can't be a discussion. It is a law and order situation. (*Interruptions*)... You can make a passing reference. (*Interruptions*)... I am allowing. (*Interruptions*)... You go ahead. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Hon' Deputy Chairman, Sir, ...(*Interruptions*)... Even if some persons kill the people, we can't discuss it in the House. It is most respectfully submitted that a situation of terror has been prevailing, particularly in Kannur district of Kerala. (*Interruptions*)... While killing of non-Communist political workers have been continuing for the last. (*Interruptions*)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, that has not been admitted. (*Interruptions*)... That is not the notice. (*Interruptions*)... That has not been admitted. (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: This is the notice. .(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI A. VIJAYARAGHAVAN: Sir, I am on a point of order. (*Interruptions*)... That can't be accepted. (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: This is the notice. (*Interruptions*)... This is the notice, Sir, and you can allow us to speak. (*Interruptions*)... What is this? (*Interruptions*)... I don't understand it. .(*Inte ptions*)... The entire country is watching us. (*Interruptions*)... How

can it be? ...(*Interruptions*)... How can you do? ...(*Interruptions*)... Is only Delhi important and not Kerala? ...(*Interruptions*)... Isn't Kannur important? (*Interruptions*)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Venkaiah Naidu. (*Interruptions*)...

श्री एम॰ वैंकैया नायडु: सर, दिल्ली में कांच टूटा, वह भी उनके हिसाब से,सबके हिसाब से निंदनीय है, मगर वहां लोगों की गर्दन कट गई, क्या वह इश्यू नहीं है? ...(**व्यवधान**)... यह हमको समझ में नहीं आ रहा है। ...(**व्यवधान**)... लोगों की गर्दन टूटी, लोगों को मारा गया। ...(**व्यवधान**)...

श्री उपसभापति: नहीं, नहीं। It is law and order situation.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: We want a discussion on this. (*Interruptions*)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Venkaiah Naidu, Please. (*Interruptions*).. राजीव शुक्ल जी, प्लीज बैठिए। ...(**व्यवधान**) ...(*Interruptions*)... I agree that sometimes reference has to be made. I am not saying that you totally restrict it. But we have not discussed the total law and order situation on a substantive notice . We have not discussed it. When you had raised a State subject, it was taken up. When they had raised a State subejct, it was taken up. About every State where you are ruling they have raised some issues, but we have not taken them up. (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI ARUN SHOURIE (Uttar Pradesh): But Gujarat has been discussed. (*Interruptions*)... As Gujarat has been discussed, nothing. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI A. VIJAYARAGHAVAN: If they want a discussion, let them give a notice. (*Interruptions*)... We are ready for a discussion. ...(*Interruptions*)...

श्री एस॰ एस॰ अहलुवालिया: सर, यह घटना क्यों हुई?...(**व्यवधान**)... केरल के लिए हुई। केरल में नृशंस हत्या हुई, लोगों की गर्दन काटी, उसी पर तो यह हुआ। ...(**व्यवधान**)...

श्री उपसभापति: मिस्टर अहलुवालिया जी। ...(**व्यवधान**)... Ahluwaliaji, when it is convenient to you, to take this stand or that stand. (*Interruptions*)...

श्री एस॰ एस॰ अहलुवालिया: केरल क्या पाकिस्तान में है? ...(**व्यवधान**)... यह तो हिंदुस्तान में है। ...(**व्यवधान**)... By merely saying that is a law and order situation. ...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I said that you could make a mention. (*Interruptions*)... I said that you could made a mention. (*Interruptions*)... I can't be so strict that you should not make a mention of Kerala. (*Interruptions*)... I am not saying that. (*Interruptions*)... But you can't discuss only Kerala and treat it that way. (*Interruptions*)... You are only discussing Kerala. (*Interruptions*)... Just one minute. Your are only discussing Kerala. (*Interruptions*)... You are not discussing the attack. (*Interruptions*)... You say both and make a passing reference to Kerala. (*Interruptions*)... But you are only discussing Kerala. (*Interruptions*)... That is not the subejct. (*Interruptions*)...

डा॰ मुरली मनोहर जोशी (उत्तर प्रदेश): सर,

वह कत्ल भी करते हैं, तो चर्चा नहीं होती।

हम आह भी भरते हैं तो हो जाते हैं बदनाम। ...(**व्यवधान**)...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: I will discuss Delhi. I will discuss Mahatma Gandhi. I will discuss nationalism. I will discuss Marxism also. (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI MANOHAR JOSHI (Maharashtra): Sir, the point is very important.

SHRI A. VIJAYARAGHAVAN: Sir, he cannot say whatever he likes. He cannot say whatever he likes to say. (*Interruptions*)... Let him give a separate notice. Let him give a separate notice on Kerala. We will also discuss. (*Interruptions*)...

DR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I have allowed to make only a passing reference. (*Interruptions*)...

श्री एस॰ एस॰ अहलुवालिया: सर, जिस तरह से येचुरी जी ने एजेंडा सेट किया ...(व्यवधान)... उन्होंने ही तो बोला है, सर। ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री उपसभापति: क्या बोला? ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री एस॰ एस॰ अहलुवालिया: उन्होंने सारी बातें बोलीं। ...(व्यवधान)... उन्होंने कांस्टिट्युशन बोला, उन्होंने देश का विभाजन बोला ...(व्यवधान)... सारी बातें तो बोलीं। ...(व्यवधान)...

SHRI MANOHAR JOSHI: Sir, notices were given by both the sides. The notice which we have taken up for discussion is of Shri Yechury. Shri Yechury's notice was to be discussed. We had an understanding amongst us that we will discuss the notice, but, at the same time, the other Memers, who have given notice, would also be allowed to speak. Now if there is a difference between the contents of the notices, then a joint notice should be taken up. Therefore, it entitles everybody to speak on Kerala. But, this is not the only reason. The other reason is, if there was an attack on the Party Office of Shri Yechury, the rootcause has also to be seen. That is what these people are explaining. ...(*Interruptions*)... They are going into the rootcause.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I would not like to enter into ...(*Interruptions*)... A notice was given. ...(*Interruptions*)... I cannot. ...(*Interruptions*)... Your are a former Speaker. I cannot enter into an argument with you. There are certain rules. The Chair has to function according to those rules. You may say anything. But the Chair has to function according to rules.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, the Members who have given notice, the Chair, the House, all of us are bound by rules. We are aware of it. We are not at the mercy of the Marxist Party. Let me make it very clear. If they think that they can dictate (*Interruptions*)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Why are you putting certain things. (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: They are not allowing me to speak. Are we at their mercy?

MR DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: We have a lot of business. Let us go ahead.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Yesterday, a group of 50 CPM workers. (*Interruptions*)... I am reading a newspaper report.I will authenticate it. (*Interruptions*)... Sir, see the intoleranc and impatience.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: He is talking about Delhi. Please allow him to speak.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: They came to the spot and shouted anti-BJP slogans and burgled into the building and vandalised the office. The police said that the CPM workers have set on fire the office furniture, TV and other record. This incident had occurred after the State Home Minister called both the parties.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Where? (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Shouldn't Kerala be discussed? Can we say it? Why are they afraid? (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: We are prepared for discussion on Kerala. Let them give a separate notice. (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: We have given a notice. (*Interruptions*)... Sir, we are the main Opposition Party. (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: You give a separate notice. We will discuss that. Don't hijack this discussion. (*Interruptions*)...

श्री कलराज मिश्र: यह जो चाहें नोटिस दें, क्या उसके आधार पर ही बोला जाएगा। ...(**व्यवधान**)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Members give notice in a different way. It is the convention of this House that if a subject which has been admitted for Zero Hour mention, basically, that is done under a rule. Under the rule, the attack in Delhi was the main issue. That is why it has been admitted. Incidentally, the notice, which they have given, is connected with that. We just included it. Now, if it is argued that the content of this notice has been admitted, then we should be very careful in future.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Yes; we have to be extra careful. Otherwise, a major Opposition party will be denied an opportunity, when they are making serious allegation...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Naidu, nobody is denying you. ...*(Interruptions)* Mr. Madhu, please ...*(Interruptions)*

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, this is what is happening in Kerala. That is exactly my point .....*(Interruptions)*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr.Madhu, please sit down.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, in today's notice there is a reference to the Babri structure. There is a reference to Mahatma Gandhi. There is a reference to freedom struggle. There is reference to Bangalore.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Where are all these?

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: He spoke on all these issues .....*(Interruptions)*

श्री उदय प्रताप सिंह (उत्तर प्रदेश): सर, समय सीमा निर्धारित होनी चाहिए. ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री उपसभापति: सबके लिए समय सीमा है। Please conclude, Mr. Venkaiah Naidu.

श्री एम. वेंकैया नायडु: मेरा सिर्फ इतना ही कहना है कि हमको भी बोलने का अधिकार है, हमारा view point रखने का अधिकार है और जनता ने हमें चुनकर यहां भेजा है। This is the Council of States. We have a responsibility to highlight what is happening...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: This is the Zero Hour Mention...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Kindly allow me, Sir.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I am allowing every body. This has been going on since 12.46 p.m.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Voice should be allowed, not noise. So far, there is only noise on the other side.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: It happens every time.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Unfortunately, it should not happen. My point is, when these incidents took place, the Leader of the Opposition spoke to the Union Home Minister and requested him to intervene in the matter and urged upon him to set right the situation. It is not only the Leader of the Opposition, but the Congress (I) President-I do not want to take the name; otherwise, they will take objection- also has urged upon the Central Government to depute Central forces. The fact that the Leader of the Opposition sat on a *dharna* speaks of the seriousness of the situation. Here also, Members were protesting as to whether we should protest in front of each other's office. We have to put an end to this once and for all. That will be a healthy practice. As the General Secretary of the Party, as the President of the Party, I have seen how many times these great champions had demonstrated before our office. Sir, coming to my point, stones were pelted on these people, who went there to protest. They have been injured and they are in hospital. Why is there this selective condemnation? If my friend's car is damaged, it is a very serious issue. But if my worker's life is taken away, it is not a serious issue. I can understand his concern about his car. I can understand their concern about the *Sarkar*. We must also understand my concern about the people of the State of Kerala, and the innocent workers of the BJP, who have been attacked by the CPI (M) people here, in the capital itself. I want to know from the Union Home Minister as to why there is selective registration of FIRs. When the other side went and complained, that was not registered. Why is no action taken then? Why are you contemplating to arrest only one set of people? Are you honest? Are you true to your conscience, true to the Constitution of India? You are there as representative of the Constitution, not of a particular party. Your Government's existence does depend on their support. I do understand that. At the same time, you have the responsibility towards the country. I urge upon the Home Minister to see to it that the complaints given by the other side are registered and also that the people, who are injured and are in hospitals, are taken care of . I also request him to immediately order an inquiry-whatever be the nature of inquiry they want to have- into it and see to it that the people, who are involved in this, are punished. I also want the Central Government to direct the Government of Kerala to use its power and see to it that the lives and properties of the political parties in Kerala are protected.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY (Puducherry): Mr. Deputy Chairman Sir, I heard with attention the speech of the hon. Member, Shri Yechury, and also the sermons given by Shri Venkaiah Naidu on the subject. While speaking, Shri Venkaiah Naidu was referring to more about Kerala than the subject, which is, the attack on the CPI (M) Headquarters in Delhi. He was concentrating more on Kerala. Sir, I would like to add only one word about Kerala. Not only were people belonging to the RSS killed, even people belonging to the CPM were also killed. In Kannure, people belonging to both the parties were killed. But I am not going into the main aspect of it. Mr. Venkaiah Naidu is talking of only one side, he is not referring to the CPM cadres. ...*(Interruptions)* He was not referring to the CPM cadres. *(Interruptions)* It is as if only their people have been attacked and the CPM people have not been attacked by them *(Interruptions)* Sir, yesterday, we were at the Kisan rally and we heard that the CPM headquarters have been attacked by the RSS cadre. We visited the CPM headquarters. We went there. The information we got was that the RSS people had gathered at the Hindu Mahasabha office at Jhandewalan. I would like to bring it to the notice of the hon. Home

Minister that the RSS people had gathered at the Hindu Mahasabha office from where they had proceeded to the CPM headquarters. A Government vehicle was being used by the Leader of Opposition in the Delhi Assembly and in that all the stones were kept. This is a very serious matter. *(Interruptions)* The Mayor of Delhi was also accompanying them. The RSS cadre came there and in broad daylight attacked the CPM headquarters and also the vehicles. It is a * on the part of the BJP and the RSS. ...*(Interruptions)*... Sir, there is a rule of law; there is the Constitution. We are in a democratic country. We are not in a barbarian society. *(Interruptions)* Can these RSS people, the Bajrang Dal people, the VHP people, the BJP people go and attack anybody? ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: Have you talked to Chacko or Chandy? *(Interruptions)*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Ahluwaliaji, please sit down. *(Interruptions)* Please sit down. *(Interruptions)* Please sit down.

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: What are you doing here?

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: Ahluwaliaji, please sit down. We are in a civilised society where law and order has to be enforced by the Government. *(Interruptions)* I know what is happening in Chandigarh. *(Interruptions)*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Nothing will go on record except what Shri Narayanasamy is speaking.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: I know how systematically no action is being taken. This is another * One hundred and twelve incidents have taken place in Madhya Pradesh; minority people were killed. *(Interruptions)* It is a* *(Interruptions)*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, no. You confine yourself to the subject.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: Sir, I would like to know from the hon. Home Minister what his Intelligence agencies have been doing. They come in a procession in broad daylight and attack the CPM headquarters. Additional police force has not been deployed there. How can political parties do anything they like and go scot-free? This is what happened in Delhi. Sir, it is a very serious incident. It had been pre-planned by the RSS and the BJP. I would like to bring this to the notice of the hon. Home Minister. Sir, nobody should be allowed to take law into his own hands. *(Interruptions)* Sir, nobody should take revenge against any political party. Venkaiah Naiduji was saying that the root cause of the attack was Kannure. I would like to say that this incident has taken place. It is a law and order problem which is a State Subject. The State Government will take care of this. *(Interruptions)*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, no. I do not want any further... *(Interruptions)*.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: Sir, I want the hon. Home Minister to take strict action against the RSS. They do not believe in democracy. *(Interruptions)*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Shri Uday Pratap Singh. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: They don't believe in democracy. *(Interruptions)*

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE, MINISTRY OF COMMERCE AND INDUSTRY (SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH): Sir, I want to make one small point.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No. Only one Member from each Party. That has been agreed.

*Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH: Sir, I just want to make one small point about what Shri Venkaiah Naidu has said. I do not want to create any controversy. *(Interruptions)* Please listen to what I am saying. *(Interruptions)*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You say this to Mr. Narayanasamy. *(Interruptions)* Mr. Narayanasamy, I have called the next speaker.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: Sir, Mr. Venkaiah Naidu spoke for 40 minutes ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now, the Members cannot go on insinuating the Chair 'that you have done this, you have done that'. At that time, there was disturbance ...*(Interruptions)*... That was not there. Please confine to the subject. Let the business go on ...*(Interruptions)*... You should help the Chair ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: Sir, I would like to submit that it is high time the Government of India should ban the RSS in this country ...*(Interruptions)*... They will see that law and order prevails in the country ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU:*

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA:*

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: This is my demand of this Government. ...*(Interruptions)*... The RSS should be banned. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: It is his view ...*(Interruptions)*... Mr. Poojary, please sit down ...*(Interruptions)*... Mr. Narayanasamy, please sit down. ...*(Interruptions)*... Mr. Narayanasamy, I have called the next speaker. ...*(Interruptions)*... You have said whatever you wanted to say. You have put forward your demand before the Home Minister. ...*(Interruptions)*... Now, please sit down. ...*(Interruptions)*... Nothing will go on record. ...*(Interruptions)*... Nothing will go on record. ...*(Interruptions)*... I have not identified ...*(Interruptions)*... Mr Narayanasamy, please sit down.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU:*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Narayanasamy, please conclude. ...*(Interruptions)*... Please conclude ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: That is my demand ...*(Interruptions)*... We will do that ...*(Interruptions)*... You can attack CPM Office, ...*(Interruptions)*... you can kill anybody, you go and attack anybody and still remain scot-free. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: There is a limit. ...*(Interruptions)*... Mr. Narayanasamy, please conclude. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU:*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Nothing will go on record. ...*(Interruptions)*... I have not identified anybody. ...*(Interruptions)*... Nothing will go on record ...*(Interruptions)*... Nothing will go on record. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: Who took the terrorists to Afghanistan? Who did it? ...*(Interruptions)*... You have done it. ...*(Interruptions)*...

---

*Not recorded.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now, nothing will go on record. ...*(Interruptions)*... Mr. Narayanasamy, please sit down. ...*(Interruptions)*... I seek cooperation from every side. This is a Zero Hour Mention. If you don't adhere to the time- limit, they will not adhere; if they don't adhere, they will not adhere. How can I run the House? ...*(Interruptions)*... How can I run the House? You have been given the time ...*(Interruptions)*... Now, I have called the next speaker, Shri Uday Pratap Singh.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: Sir, let me conclude. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You conclude, please. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA:*

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU:*

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: Sir, I will not withdraw it. ...*(Interruptions)*... Sir, I want to know from the hon. Minister as to what action has been taken by the Government so far against ...*(Interruptions)*... And, what follow up action the Government is going to take in this regard? ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, that reference to the RSS is unwanted. That should be removed from the record. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, no; I will have to examine it ...*(Interruptions)*...'RSS' has been mentioned by everybody.

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: Sir, that should be removed. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: How? That will be decided. ...*(Interruptions)*... Why? ...*(Interruptions)*... क्या बात है? उन्होंने कहा ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री एम. वेंकैया नायडुः वह unwanted है। ...(व्यवधान)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: What is unparliamentary about it? ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री एम. वेंकैया नायडुः अनपार्लियामेंटरी का सवाल नहीं है। ...(व्यवधान)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I will have to examine it carefully. ...*(Interruptions)*... I will have to examine it carefully and let you know ...*(Interruptions)*... I will examine it, according to the rules. ...*(Interruptions)*... I will examine it, according to the rules. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Narayanasamy, I will examine according to the rules. *(Interruptions)* Mr. Poojary, please sit down. Now, Mr. Uday Pratap Singh. *(Interruptions)* Nothing will go on record ...(व्यवधान)... आप बोलिए। ...(व्यवधान)... उन्हें बोलने दीजिए। ...(व्यवधान)... आप बोलिए। ...(व्यवधान)...

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY:*

श्री एस॰ एस॰ अहलुवालियाः*

श्री उदय प्रताप सिंहः वे लोग बोल रहे हैं। ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री उपसभापतिः उन्हें बोलने दीजिए। ...(व्यवधान)... Mr. Narayanasamy, please sit down. I have called the name of the other speaker. Please allow him to speak. I have not asked you to speak now. *(Interruptions)*

*Not recorded.

श्री उदय प्रताप सिंह : माननीय उपसभापति महोदय। यह बहुत गंभीर मामला है। यह केवल दो दलों के बीच का मामला नहीं है। अभी सदन में जिस तरह की बहस हो रही है, वह हमारे लोकतांत्रिक स्तर की गिरावट का प्रतीक है। हम लोगों को दुख इस बात का होना चाहिए था कि इतनी बड़ी दुर्घटना हुई, जिसमें दिल्ली जैसे शहर में एक दफ्तर पर हमला किया गया। होना यह चाहिए था कि हम इसके कारणों में जाते और भविष्य में यह काम न होते जिससे हमारे लोकतंत्र की, हमारी संसद की, हमारे राष्ट्र की और हमारे संविधान की मर्यादा न गिरती। मैं समझता हूं कि तब वह बहस ज्यादा सार्थक होती और इस बहस का जो उपयोग हो सकता था, वह होता। हिंसा किसी भी तरह की हो, वह बहुत बुरी है। लेकिन हिंसा अगर राजनैतिक उद्देश्यों की पूर्ति के लिए की जाती है तो यह लोकतंत्र की विपरीत स्थिति है। इसलिए हमें चिंता इस बात की होनी चाहिए कि इस प्रकार की घटनाएं भविष्य में न हों। शायद इसीलिए यह बहस की गयी थी। मैं एक बात कहना चाहता हूं कि अगर हम पिछली बातों को कहते रहे – हमने यह कहा कि पहले आपने यह किया था, आपने वह किया था –तो इस बहस का न तो कोई अर्थ निकलने वाला है और न हम कहीं लाभ पर पहुंचेंगे।

नज़र में जिनके मुस्तकबिल के जलवे रक्स करते हैं,
वे रोदाद-ए-ज़रर माझी को दोहराया नहीं करते।

हम लोग जो दोहरा रहे हैं, उससे हम लागों को कुछ हासिल होने वाला नहीं है। यह बहुत शर्मनाक घटना है। इस तरह से संविधान कैसे चलेगा, लोकतंत्र कैसे चलेगा, संसद कैसे चलेगी? आज पूरा हिन्दुस्तान देख रहा है, पूरी दुनिया देख रही है। हमें चिंता इस बात की होनी चाहिए कि इससे हमारे राष्ट्र की, हमारे लोकतंत्र की, हमारी संसद की गरिमा में गिरावट आ रही है। इसलिए मैं यह कहना चाहता हूं कि ऐसा नहीं होना चाहिए कि हम यह कहें कि आपने पिछली बार यह किया था या वह किया था। मैं अपने आदरणीय भाइयों से कहना चाहता हूं कि यदि आपके यहां किसी ने ऐसा किया है तो आपकों भी उसकी निन्दा करनी चाहिए। ऐसा नहीं होना चाहिए कि वे आपकी पार्टी के हैं इसलिए उन्होंने अगर कोई गलत काम कर दिया तो उनको बचा लिया। ...(**व्यवधान**)...

एक माननीय सदस्य: आपने टीवी में नहीं देखा। ...(**व्यवधान**)...

श्री उदय प्रताप सिंह: मैंने देखा है। जिन्होंने यह काम किया है, मैं उनकी निन्दा कर रहा हूं। ...(**व्यवधान**)... सर, यह तो चोर की दाढ़ी में तिनका वाली बात हो रही है। ...(**व्यवधान**)...

श्री उपसभापति: उन्हें बोलने दीजिए। ...(**व्यवधान**)...

श्री प्यारे लाल खंडेलवाल (मध्य प्रदेश): सर, ...(**व्यवधान**)...

श्री उपसभापति: खंडेलवाल जी, बोलने दीजिए। ...(**व्यवधान**)... यह क्या बात है? ...(**व्यवधान**)..

श्री उदय प्रताप सिंह: महोदय, आपको याद होगा कि सुबह जब अंदर बात हो रही थी कि आज क्या होगा, तब भी मैंने अंदर कहा था कि अगर यह बहस हो तो इस बात पर हो कि भविष्य में इस प्रकार की दुर्घटनाएं न घटें। इसलिए मैं आप सबसे अपील करता हूं कि इस विषय पर कृपा करके एक दूसरे के ऊपर कीचड़ मत उछालिए। हम समझते हैं कि सबसे ज्यादा चर्चा का विषय तो आप ही लोग हैं, आपने ही शुरुआत की। महोदय, हम यह कहना चाहते हैं कि हमारे गृह मंत्री जी इस घटना को गंभीरता से लें और यथाशीघ्र इसका पूरा विवरण सदन के पटल पर रखें। इसके अलावा हम आपस में बैठकर इस प्रकार की व्यवस्था करें जिससे इस प्रकार की घटनाओं की पुनरावृत्ति न हो। मैं इस घटना की घोर निंदा करता हूं और इस मामले में आपसे अपील करता हूं कि प्रभावी कार्यवाही करें।

प्रो॰ राम देव भंडारी: माननीय उपसभापति जी, मैंने सदन के बड़े दलों के नेताओं को सुना। कल जो घटना हुई है, आज के सभी समाचार-पत्रों में इसका जिक्र आया है। ...(**व्यवधान**)...

श्री विजय कुमार रूपाणी (गुजरात): लालू जी चले गये! ...(**व्यवधान**)...

प्रो॰ राम देव भंडारी: लालू जी के प्रतिनिधि हैं, उनके प्रतिनिधि बोल रहे हैं। ...(**व्यवधान**)...उपसभापति जी, आज के जनसत्ता में येचुरी जी की कार पर हमला हुआ है, उसकी तस्वीर छपी है। ...(**व्यवधान**)...

श्री उपसभापति: आप अखबार मत दिखाइये। आप मेंशन कीजिए। आपके बोलने से भी वह रिकार्ड में जायेगा। ...(**व्यवधान**)...

प्रो॰ राम देव भंडारी: उपसभापति जी, हम एक पॉलिटिकल सिस्टम, डेमोक्रेटिक सिस्टम से चलते हैं, पार्टियां भी उसी सिस्टम से चलती हैं, सरकार भी उसी सिस्टम से चल रही हैं। बीजेपी सबसे बड़ी पार्टी तो नहीं है, लेकिन दूसरी सबसे बड़ी पार्टी है इस देश की। कांग्रेस पहली बड़ी पार्टी और बीजेपी दूसरी बड़ी पार्टी है। जो बड़ी पार्टियां होती हैं, उनसे हम यह आशा करते हैं कि उनके जो क्रियाकलाप होंगे, वे दूसरी पाटियों का मार्गदर्शन करेंगे। अगर कोई बड़ी पार्टी इस प्रकार का आचरण करती है, जिससे कंट्री में गलत संदेश जाता है, तो वह कंट्री के लिए अच्छी बात नहीं है। कुन्नूर की बहुत चर्चा हो रही थी, तस्वीर भी दिखायी जा रही थीं, मैं एक सवाल इन पार्टी के लोगों से पूछना चाहता हूं कि अगर किसी एक प्रदेश में कोई हिंसक घटना होती है, क्या उसका बदला दूसरे प्रदेश में हिंसक घटनाओं से लिया जाना चाहिए। महोदय, कल जो कुछ हुआ अच्छा नहीं हुआ । कल गोपालन भवन में बैठक हो रही थी और उस बैठक पर हमला करने भारतीय जनता पार्टी, हिंदू मंच, आरएसएस इन सभी दलों और संस्थाओं के लोग आये, कारों में आये और उसमें पत्थर भरकर आये! ...**(व्यवधान)**... अभी हमारे एक साथी कह रहे थे कि इन्होंने पत्थर चलाया। सीपीआई (एम) की ओर से पत्थर चलाये गये। मैं पूछना चाहता हूं कि क्या किसी पार्टी कार्यालय में पत्थर जमा करके रखे जाते हैं? ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री एस॰एस॰ अहलुवालिया: आपने टी॰वी॰ नहीं देखा है। आपने टी॰वी॰ नहीं देखा है। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री उपसभापति: अहलुवालिया जी, आप उनको बोलने दीजिए। ...**(व्यवधान)**... अहलुवालिया जी, अहलुवालिया जी, आप ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री एस॰एस॰ अहलुवालिया: डंडा लेकर मारा। ...**(व्यवधान)**... रोड पर पुलिस ...**(व्यवधान)**... पुलिस को अंदर से लाठी छीनते हुए दिखाया है। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री अजय मारू (झारखंड): उपसभापति महोदय, ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री उपसभापति: अजय मारू जी, अजय मारू जी, ...**(व्यवधान)**...अजय मारू जी, आप बैठ जाइये। ...**(व्यवधान)**.... पाणि जी, ...**(व्यवधान)**...

प्रो॰ राम देव भंडारी: अहलुवालिया जी, क्या आप अपने पार्टी कार्यालय में पत्थर रखते हैं? ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री उपसभापति: आप बैठ जाइये। आप उनको बोलने दीजिए। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

प्रो॰ राम देव भंडारी: अहलुवालिया जी, क्या आप पार्टी कार्यालय में पत्थर रखते हैं? आप पत्थर नहीं रखते होंगे। ....**(व्यवधान)**... अपने कार्यालय में दूसरे भी पत्थर नहीं रखते हैं। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री उपसभापति: आप उनको बोलने दीजिए। ...**(व्यवधान)**... आप बोलिए। ...**(व्यवधान)**... भंडारी जी, आप उनसे बहस मत कीजिए। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

प्रो॰ राम देव भंडारी: पत्थरों से लैस कारों में सब लोग आये और हमला किया, यह बहुत निंदनीय घटना हुई है। पूरे सदन को इस घटना की निंदा करनी चाहिए। ...**(व्यवधान)**... अगर एक जगह हिंसक घटनाएं होती हैं, तो उसका बदला दूसरी जगह पर नहीं लिया जाए। महोदय, हम एक पॉलिटिकल सिस्टम वाले लोग हैं, राजनीति में वोट से बदला लिया जाता है, धरना से, प्रदर्शन से, वोट से बदला लिया जाता है। हम विरोधियों को वोट से हराकर बदला लेते हैं। केरल में नहीं हरा सके, बंगाल में भी इनको कुछ नहीं मिला। महोदय, इनको गुस्सा इस तरह नहीं उतारना चाहिए। हमारी पार्टी के नेता श्री लालू प्रसाद जी ने इसकी घोर निंदा की है। ...**(व्यवधान)**... निंदा की है, यह सच्चाई है। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री उपसभापति: ठीक है, ठीक है, आप बोलिए। वह बोलेंगे। ...**(व्यवधान)**... आपको वह बोलेंगे। आप बालते रहिए। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

प्रो॰ राम देव भंडारी: महोदय, माननीय लालू प्रसाद जी ने इसकी घोर निंदा की है और हम सभी इसकी निंदा करते हैं। मैं आदरणीय जोशी जी की एक बात सुन रहा था। उन्होंने कहा कि जो घटना हुई है, उसके रूट कॉज में जाना चाहिए। महोदय, अगर रूट कॉज में जायेंगे, तो दूसरी जगह पर भी जायेंगे। ...**(व्यवधान)**... हमको गुजरात भी जाना पड़ेगा, हमको गुजरात भी रूट कॉज को खोजने के लिए जाना पड़ेगा ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री विजय कुमार रूपाणी: आप गुजरात जाइये। ...(**व्यवधान**)...

प्रो॰ राम देव भंडारी: ट्रेन में जो 58 लोग जलाये गये थे ...(**व्यवधान**)...

श्री उपसभापति: देखिए, आप बैठ जाइये। ...(**व्यवधान**)...

प्रो॰ राम देव भंडारी: इतनी बड़ी संख्या में मुस्लिम भाई-बहन मारे गए थे, उसके रूट कॉज में जाना पड़ेगा ...(**व्यवधान**)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Nothing will go on record except what Mr. Bhandary speaks.

प्रो॰ राम देव भंडारी: महोदय, हिंसा, खून-खराबा और हत्या यह रास्ता ठीक नहीं है। हम गांधी जी के देश में रहते हैं। ...(**व्यवधान**)... (**समय की घंटी**) वैसे गांधी जी की हत्या कैसे हुई, हम सब लोग जानते हैं। ...(**व्यवधान**)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN; Nothing will go on record except what Mr. Bhandary speaks.

प्रो॰ राम देव भंडारी: हम गांधी जी के देश में रहते हैं। ...(**व्यवधान**)...

श्री उपसभापति: आप बैठिए। देखिए, पाणि जी .....।

प्रो॰ राम देव भंडारी: महोदय, ये लोग गांधी जी का नाम सुनकर क्यों भड़कते हैं। इनका गांधी जी में विश्वास नहीं है। इनका विश्वास नाथूराम गोडसे में है, गांधी जी में नहीं है। ...(**व्यवधान**)... महोदय, जितने लोग घायल हुए हैं, उनमें पुलिस के लोग भी घायल हुए हैं। मैं माननीय गृह मंत्री जी से अनुरोध करना चाहूंगा कि इस तरह की जो घटनाएं होती हैं, अगर पोलिटिकल लोग रहते भी हैं, जो ट्रीटमेंट क्रिमिनल्ज़ के साथ किया जाता है, वैसा ही ट्रीटमेंट ऐसे लोगों के साथ किया जाना चाहिए। जो इस प्रकार पोलिटिकल पार्टी पत्थर बाजी में विश्वास करती हैं, खून-खराबा करती हैं और अन्य तरह-तरह का अपराध करती हैं।

SHRI D. RAJA: Thank you, Sir, for giving me this opportunity. My party strongly condemns the attack on the CPM headquarters in Delhi. The attack was carried out with a sinister design by RSS, BJP and those who belong to their outfits. We are a democracy. Our democracy is hailed as the largest democracy in the world. It is a Parliamentary democracy. It is a multi-party democracy. Thanks to Dr. Ambedkar and other architects of our Constitution, we have a Constitution which is a republican Constitution. Now, there is a threat to this republican Constitution from RSS. RSS wants to impose an illiberal, monolithic, medieval, theocratic order on the people. *(Interruptions)*

श्री उपसभापति: इनको बोलने दीजिए।

SHRI D. RAJA: This is the way I tried to see the problem because it is not just an attack on the headquarters of one political party.

SHRI ARUN JAITLEY (Gujarat): Sir, are you, in future, going to allow similar adjectives to be used for other political organisations and other organisations? You are now laying down a precedent and this precedent will apply in future.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: We have been observing and if there are unparliamentary statements, we will examine it. If it is unparliamentary, we will remove it. I have to look into it.

SHRI D. RAJA: This is the level of tolerance, which we witness in this House. What I am trying to say is, today, it is an attack on CPM headquarters. Tomorrow, it can be an attack on some other party's headquarters and the day after tomorrow, it can be the residence of one party leader. Where is the end? Is this the quality of politics which we have in India today? And you talk about civilisation and you claim to be proud of India's civilisation! Is it in tune

with the civilisational values which we cherish today? That is why this issue should be taken seriously. If it is allowed unchallenged, unquestioned, then it will have a deep impact on whatever values we have today in the polity of our country. That is why we strongly condemn this kind of attack. In fact, BJP also should be condemning this and it is not a matter of partisan issue. It is a matter of preserving our democratic quality. Are you interested in preserving this democratic quality? If you do not, then, you declare it. Then, people are there to take up the challenge. That is why we are condemning this attack; this House should unanimously condemn this attack; and the whole country should condemn this attack. This cannot go unchallenged on the pretext of this thing or that thing. That is why our party strongly condemn this attack in the strongest possible terms. We will have to take up the challenge on our Republican Constitution. There is a challenge to the Republican values in India, Republic Constitution of India and there are some elements which try to impose some kind of a theocratic order and that is why there is no tolerance. There is no respect for democracy. There is no respect for secularism in the country. If this attack is meant to scare the Communist Movement, I declare, on the floor of this House, that the Communist Movement cannot be scared or intimidated by this kind of an attack. That is what I am saying. And, let us be very clear. You are not challenging the Communist Movement; you are challenging the very democratic polity of our country. That is what I accuse. You are challenging the democratic polity of our country...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Raja, please conclude.

SHRI D. RAJA: Sir, if Parliamentary democracy has to thrive in India, if secular democracy has to be protected in India, this kind of an attack needs to be condemned by the House unanimously.

SHRIMATI KANIMOZHI (Tamil Nadu): Sir, the pre-planned and brutal attack on the headquarters of the CPI (M), a national party and that too...

श्री विजय कुमार रूपाणी: वह तो आप नहीं बोलेंगे...(व्यवधान).. हमला हुआ..(व्यवधान).. वह आप नहीं बोलेंगे. ..(व्यवधान)..

SHRIMATI KANIMOZHI: Yes, certainly, it is pre-planned, because obviously, there was a car in which stones were brought in and many hon. Members have also mentioned it here. So, obviously, it was pre-planned and that too such an incident happening in the capital of the country is highly deplorable and we condemn it in the strongest possible terms.

Sir, this has not happened for the first time. It happened to one in of our most revered leaders, Shri Kamraj, here in Delhi. There is no place for such hooliganism in democracy. Our leader, Dr. Kalaignar, has already condemned this violence, unleashed not only against the CPI(M) but also against the democratic polity of this country. Hence, on behalf of our leader, Dr. Kalaignar, and our party, I appeal to the Government not to take a tolerant view, but to take a stern action and these acts have to be considered on par with terrorist activities and condemn them. Thank you.

DR. V. MAITREYAN (Tamil Nadu): Sir, last year there was a dance of democracy in Chennai...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI ARUN JAITLEY: Sir, will the hon. Member condemn with same tone and tenor the DMK attack and demonstrations on BJP offices all over Tamil Nadu?...*(Interruptions)*... Do you use the same language.

श्री अवनि राय (पश्चिमी बंगाल): उपसभापति जी, इसमें कोई दो राय नहीं है कि कल दिल्ली में जो घटना घटी है, वह दुखदायक है। मेरा सबसे पहले एक प्रश्न है कि हम सभी लोग, सभी पार्टियां संसद में देश को चलाने के लिए बैठती हैं, यह विषय लेकर जो चर्चा हो रही है, वह घटना और चर्चा दोनों ही दुखदायक हैं। सबसे बड़ी बात यह है कि इसमें गृह मंत्रालय, जिसकी सबसे अहम भूमिका है, इसे देखना चाहिए कि पूरे देश में एक के बाद एक ऐसी घटना घटती चली जा रही है। मैं मिनिस्ट्री ऑफ होम अफेयर्स से – बाहर जो होता है, वह तो है ही, लेकिन इंटरनली जो बार-बार मामले हो रहे हैं, उनको नजरअंदाज करेंगे तो हमारे लिए मुश्किलें पैदा होंगी और इससे गणतंत्रीय व्यवस्था के लिए भी खतरा पैदा हो सकता है। मैं सभी साथियों से, जितनी पोलिटिकल पार्टीज हैं, सभी से यह कह रहा हूं कि हमें यह देखना चाहिए कि कहीं भी ऐसा न हो। जो आज हुआ है, वह कल कहीं और न हो, यह हमें देखना चाहिए। मेरा दूसरा प्रश्न यह कि जो घटना लिखी हैं, उसमें आर.एस.एस. की बात है। मैं इतने दिनों तक पार्लियामेंट में रहने के बाद यह नहीं समझ पा रहा हूं कि आर.एस.एस. की पालिटिकल पार्टी बी.जे.पी. है या नहीं है और बी.जे.पी. आर.एस.एस. के साथ की है या नहीं है? यह बड़े आश्चर्य का विषय है कि वे कहते है कि हम नहीं हैं, हमारा कोई पोलिटिकल विंग नहीं है। ये कहते हैं कि हम उनके साथ नहीं है। लेकिन घटना घटने के बाद यह जो बात चली है, इसका भी फैसला हो जाना चाहिए। मैं इसे बड़ी गंभीरता से लेता हूं। इस घटना पर, कि हमारा पोलिटिकल पार्टी से कोई रिश्ता नहीं है, यह बोलने की जरूरत नहीं है। Why should we kill the time of Parliament? We must think about the national programmes, and the national problems must be solved. But the Home Ministry should be alert to all these things. Not a single civilian should die, get killed or murdered in this way. I want an assurance from the Home Ministry that it will look into all these things. Everywhere, every day, something is going on. Under no circumstances, we should allow it. We condemn it, whether it happens in AKG Bhawan or it happens somewhere else. I am not going to name them. But, it should be condemned by every political party. Thank you.

श्री तारिक अनवर (महाराष्ट्र): उपसभापति महोदय, मैं भी अपनी पार्टी की ओर से जो घटना कल घटी हैं, मैं उसकी निन्दा करता हूं। जैसा और लोगों ने कहा कि लोकतंत्र में, लोकशाही में किसी तरह की हिंसा की कोई गुंजाइश नहीं है। खास तौर पर मैं यह समझता हूं कि अगर कोई भी जिम्मेदार पार्टी ऐसा काम करती है, तो मैं समझता हूं कि यह जो हमारी परम्परा है, हम जिस संविधान की शपथ लेते हैं और हम जिसकी चर्चा करते हैं, यह उसकी भावना के विपरीत है। नायडु साहब कल की घटना को justify कर रहे थे, मेरी समझ में नहीं आया कि यहां क्यों रनेजपलि किया जा रहा है। कोई भी हिंसा की घटना हो, सबकी तरफ से उसकी निन्दा होनी चाहिए।...(**व्यवधान**)... मैं यह कह रहा हूं कि कहीं भी.. (**व्यवधान**)...मैं वही कह रहा हूं...(**व्यवधान**)...

श्री उपसभापति: अजय मारू जी, प्लीज।

श्री तारिक अनवर: चाहे वह घटना केरल में हो या देश के किसी भी कोने में हो, सबकी निन्दा होनी चाहिए। ...(**व्यवधान**)...सबकी निन्दा होनी चाहिए। जैसा चेयर से भी यह बात कही गई कि यह मामला स्टेट का है। जहां तक कानून-व्यवस्था का मामला है, अगर केरल में कोई घटना घटी, अगर आप वहां धरना करते, peaceful तरीके से demonstration करते, तो किसी को कोई ऐतराज नहीं होता। अगर आपको यह था कि ...(**व्यवधान**)...अगर आपको यह था कि दिल्ली में होना चाहिए, जहां तक कानून-व्यवस्था का प्रश्न है, तो आप गृह मंत्री के घर पर जाकर demonstration करते, आप प्रधान मंत्री के घर पर demonstration करने, लेकिन आप एक पॉलिटिकल पार्टी के दफतर के सामने जाकर demonstration कर रहे हैं, वहां पत्थर फेंक रहे हैं। यह कहाँ की बात है, यह कहाँ का इंसाफ है? ...(**व्यवधान**)...उपसभापति महोदय, इसलिए मैं गृह मंत्री जी से कहूँगा कि कानून-व्यवस्था को हाथ में लेने का किसी को भी अधिकार नहीं होना चाहिए। Nobody is above the law. अगर कोई इस तरह की हरकत करता है, तो यकीनन हमारी जो लोकतांत्रिक व्यवस्था है, उसमें वह बाधा पैदा करता है और उसके खिलाफ कानून को अपना काम करना चाहिए, गृह मंत्री जी को अपनी कार्रवाई करनी चाहिए।

THE MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS (SHRI SHIVRAJ V. PATIL): Sir, I am thankful to the hon. Members who have participated in this debate and have expressed their views very candidly. All of them have asked me to inform them as to what happened in Delhi? I am going

to inform them about what happened in Delhi. If what happened in any other State is required to be brought to the notice of the hon. Members in this House, I shall have no difficulty; I have the information with me. But, I will be required to give information not only about one State but many States also. And, if this kind of debate is required to be done at any time and if it is allowed by the Chair, I shall have no difficulty. My only request is, Sir, that they have spoken, at times, with a little anger, but with responsibility. I would request them to hear me fully. If they object to each and every sentence, and each and very point I am making,then,they would not be able to grasp the totality of this incident and the situation and that will create the problem. That is the only request I am going to make. At the end...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, I request the hon. Minister to yield for a minute. I am not raising any new point. From morning onwards, we have been respectfully submitting to the Chair that our notice is about Kerala and Delhi also.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I have already told them about this.

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Ruling is given.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: That means we are not going to hear anything about Kerala from the hon. Home Minister. Then, what for are we here? इसलिए मैं कह रहा हूं let him be fair enough, इतने लोग मर गए, इसके बारे मे बोलना चाहिए।

SHRI SHIVRAJ V. PATIL: Mr. Deputy Chairman, Sir, whatever you direct me, I am ready to accept that...*(Interruptions)*...But the only request I want to make is, when I am speaking, please don't obstruct me. When I have completed my statement, you can ask any question. I would try to reply to those questions in the manner which is possible to me and as per the information which is available with me. But if every time...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री उपसभापति: पहले सुन लो ना, भई...(व्यवधान)...

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: Sir, my notice was very categorical. I want to know what happened in Kerala which ultimately culminated into *dharna*...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: He has not come to the details ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: We want to know that ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: He has not come to...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: That is not the point, Sir. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, the entire country is watching us. *(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please listen to me...*(Interruptions)*...Mr. Naidu, the hon. Minister has categorically said, "Don't obstruct me. After I have done, if there is any question, I will answer that."...*(Interruptions)*... This is what he has said.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, we are ready to hear the hon. Minister. ...*(Interruptions)*... We have no complaint against the hon. Home Minister, but the Home Minister is taking a plea that unless he is directed, he is not ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, no, that is for the Chair to decide. Don't put the Chair. (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: That is why we are asking the Chair.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The Chair has to follow certain rules. ...(*Interruptions*)...आप पहले सुनिए तो सही ...(व्यवधान)... He has said (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Are we kids here, Sir? Don't we understand what is happening in ...(*Interruptions*)...

2.00 P.M.

SHRIMATI SUSHMA SWARAJ (मध्य प्रदेश): Sir, I am on a point of order. सर, मेरा व्यवस्था का प्रश्न यह है कि आपको दो नोटिसिज़ दिए गए, एक हमारी तरफ से और एक सीताराम येचुरी जी की तरफ से। यहां दोनों नोटिसिज़ को मिला कर चर्चा हुई, क्योंकि दोनों घटनाएं आपस में गुंथी हुई हैं ...(**व्यवधान**)... सर, एक मिनट, मुझे पूरी बात कहने दीजिए ...(**व्यवधान**)...

श्री उपसभापति: जी हां, मैं सुन रहा हूं ना।

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज: दोनों घटनाएं आपस में गुंथी हुई हैं और एक-दूसरे से उपजी हैं। दोनों घटनाओं के तथ्य यहां पर रखे गए हैं।

SHRI PENUMALLI MADHU: Sir let me ...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Madhu, I am listening to the hon. Member. Why are you interrupting?...(*Interruptions*)...

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज: इसलिए गृहमंत्री जी का जवाब अधूरा होगा, अगर वह केवल ...(**व्यवधान**)...

SHRI PENUMALLI MADHU: Sir. both are ...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMNAN: Mr. Madhu, there is a limit for interference.

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज: सर, मेरा यह कहना है कि दोनों घटनाओं पर नोटिस दिए गए। दोनों ही घटनाएं आपस में गुंथी हुई हैं, दोनों ही घटनाओं के ऊपर यहां पर बहस हुई है, दोनों ही घटनाओं के तथ्य सदन में आए हैं, तो होम मिनिस्टर अगर केवल दिल्ली पर जवाब देंगे, तो उनका जवाब अधूरा रहेगा। इसलिए मैं यह चाहती हूं कि आप यह कहें ...(**व्यवधान**)... उन्होंने आपसे पूछा है, तो आप यह कहें कि जो बात यहां चर्चा में आई है, उन दोनों घटनाओं पर वह जवाब दें, तभी उनका जवाब पूरा होगा ...(**व्यवधान**)... अगर वह केरल को बिल्कुल छोड़ देंगे और केवल दिल्ली की बात करेंगे, तो अर्थ का अनर्थ हो जाएगा और पूरा जवाब नहीं आएगा।

श्री उपसभापति: सुषमा जी ...(**व्यवधान**)...

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज: हमें पूरा जवाब चाहिए, हमें यह आश्वासन दें ...(**व्यवधान**)... हम गृह मंत्री जी को बहुत शांति से सुनेंगे।

श्री उपसभापति: सुषमा जी, a notice was given to the Chairman. The Chairman admitted it for Zero Hour on Delhi. He has not told me to take up this matter. You can take up this matter with the Chairman...(*Interruptions*)... I cannot decide on my own. ...(*Interruptions*)...

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज: सर, ऐसा नहीं है ...(**व्यवधान**)...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, I have a point of order. My notice was for the suspension of Question Hour ...(*Interruptions*)...

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज: सर, मेरा नोटिस था ...(**व्यवधान**)... सर, हमारे नोटिस में हमने यह कहा था ...(**व्यवधान**)...सर, हमारा नोटिस ...(**व्यवधान**)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, no. All notices ...(*Interruptions*)... अब आप सुनना नहीं चाहते ...(व्यवधान)... अब मैं क्या करूं ...(**व्यवधान**)

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज: हमने यह कहा कि ...(**व्यवधान**)

श्री उपसभापति: सुषमा जी, मैंने कहा और ऑनरेबल होम मिनिस्टर ने भी कहा कि उनके जवाब देने के बाद आप सवाल पूछ सकते हैं और उसमें आप ...(**व्यवधान**)...

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज: अगर गृह मंत्री जी केरल का ...(**व्यवधान**)...

श्री एम॰ वेंकैया नायडु: हमारे पास नोटिस है ...(**व्यवधान**)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Naidu, the Chair always gets such accusations. I am not worried about that ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, we are not talking about the Chair.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You see, I gave a ruling. I said, you can make a passing reference to Kerala. I did say it. ...(*Interruptions*)... I did say it. You may disagree with me. I fully respect your view. I said that ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI ARUN JAITLEY: more than a passing reference. ...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That is your view. I respect it. But that is what I said ...(*Interruptions*)... No; no, that is correct. ...(*Interruptions*)... The hon. Home Minister has said, "don't interrupt me. I will reply." After that, if anybody wants to seek any clarifications, he can do so. ...(*Interruptions*)...

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज: सर, ...(**व्यवधान**)...

श्री उपसभापति: यह डिस्कशन केरल के ऊपर नहीं है ...(**व्यवधान**).. .It is one the attack on CPM office. ...(*Interruptions*)... Please allow him. ...(*Interruptions*)...

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज: अगर वे इस पर जवाब देंगे, तो हम शान्ति से सुनेंगे ...(**व्यवधान**) वरना इस चर्चा का कोई मतलब ही नहीं है ...(**व्यवधान**)... अगर आप इसका जवाब देंगे ...(**व्यवधान**)...अगर आप केरल पर जवाब देंगे, तो हम सुनेंगे ...(**व्यवधान**)...

श्री सीताराम येचुरी: आप इनका जवाब तो सुनिए ...(**व्यवधान**)...

श्री उपसभापति: इनका जवाब तो सुनिए ...(**व्यवधान**)... आप उसके बाद सवाल पूछिएगा ...(**व्यवधान**)... वेंकैया नायडु जी, आप उसके बाद पूछिएगा ...(**व्यवधान**)... आप क्लेरिफिकेशन पूछिए ...(**व्यवधान**)... मैं क्लेरिफिकेशन अलाऊ करूंगा, आप क्लेरिफिकेशन पूछिए ...(**व्यवधान**)... I cannot allow reply on allow law and order situation unless it has been discussed. (*Intruptions*)...

श्री एस॰एस॰ अहलुवालिया: केरल पहले ...(**व्यवधान**)... केरल पहले ...(**व्यवधान**)...

SHRI JANARDHANA POOJARY (Karnataka): Sir, you have given a ruling that no posters should be exhibited ...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I know, Mr. Poojary. All Members are ...(*Interruptions*)... Please ...(*Interruptions*)...

श्री एम॰ वेंकैया नायडु: केरल के बाद में ...(**व्यवधान**)... केरल पहले ...(**व्यवधान**)...

श्री उपसभापति: अगर आप ऑनरेबल होम मिनिस्टर की रिप्लाई सुनने को तैयार नहीं हैं, तो मैं मजबूर हूं ...(**व्यवधान**)...

श्री एस॰ एस॰ अहलुवालिया: पहले केरल पर जवाब दें ...(**व्यवधान**)...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, we want to hear the reply. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, we want a reply on the debate. The issue of killings of the people is more important. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, the whole House has condemned the attack on the CPM office ...(*Interruptions*)... They are not willing to listen to the reply. ...(*Interruptions*)... The whole House. ...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I think, I will have to close the discussion ...(*Interruptions*)... I will have to close the discussion without the reply. The hon. Minister is prepared to reply. ...(*Interruptions*)...

एक माननीय सदस्य: ...वरना इसका कोई मतलब ही नहीं है। ...(**व्यवधान**)...

श्री सीताराम येचुरी: पूर हाउस ने इस अटैक को condemn किया है। ...(**व्यवधान**)...

श्री उपसभापति: आप क्लैरिफिकेशन पूछिए ...(**व्यवधान**)... It was not the main discussion. Kerala was not the main discussion. Let me make it very, very clear. ...(*Interruptions*)...

श्री सीताराम येचुरी: पूरे हाउस ने इस को condemn किया है। ...(**व्यवधान**)... आप रिप्लाई करवाइए ...(व्यवधान)...

SHRI SHIVRAJ V. PATIL: Sir, I have absolutely no difficulty in replying to ...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: As far as the notices are concerned, I would clarify that the Chair has admitted only the ...(*Interruptions*)...

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज: नहीं सर, ...(**व्यवधान**)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I will clarify ...(*Interruptions*)...

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज: नोटिस उन्होंने रिजेक्ट नहीं किया था ...(**व्यवधान**)... जब मैंने यह बोला कि हमारा जीरो ऑवर का नोटिस है ओर उनका क्वेश्चन ऑवर सस्पेंशन को नोटिस है, तो मैंने यह कहा कि उनका क्वैश्चन ऑवर जीरो ऑवर में कन्वर्ट किया जाए ...(**व्यवधान**)..

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: It has not been admitted. ...(*Interruptions*)... It has not been admitted ...(*Interruptions*)...

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज: यह तय हुआ था। उन्होंने हमारा नोटिस रिजेक्ट नहीं किया ...(**व्यवधान**)...

श्री उपसभापति: अब मैं क्या करूं ...(**व्यवधान**)...I can't help it. ...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I cannot give directions from the Chair. If the hon. Minister wants to reply, let him do. I cannot help it. ...(*Interruptions*)... You want to hear him ...(*Interruptions*)... Please allow him to speak.

SHRI SHIVRAJ V. PATIL: Sir, let them hear me first and then form an opinion on what I have said.

SHRI MANOHAR JOSHI: We would like him to talk about Kerala also. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI SHIVRAJ V. PATIL: You will come to know what I have said ...(*Interruptions*)...

श्री उपसभापति: आप सुनिए। सुनिए तो सही,शुरू तो करने दो।

SHRI SHIVRAJ V. PATIL: You cannot ask me to start the reply from here or there. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Let the hon. Minister give us a simple assurance that the debate will be replied to, and the debate included both Kerala and Delhi.

SHRI SHIVRAJ V. PATIL: I have given the assurance that the debate would be replied to. ...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You wanted the assurance from him and he has given it.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, the debate included both Kerala and Delhi...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You wanted a reply to the debate. You may put questions. He has said that the debate will be replied to.

SHRI MANOHAR JOSHI: It includes both Kerala and Delhi...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I need to clarify...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI SHIVRAJ V. PATIL: What is this? You cannot...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, I am not dictating terms. I am not here to dictate terms. The hon. Home Minister said that he would do anything only when directed to. He said it...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Venkaiah Naidu, just now you said that the hon. Minister must give an assurance that he would reply to the debate. He said that he would reply to the debate and the debate includes whatever has been discussed in the House.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: That is what we want.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: A debate is a debate. ...(*Interruptions*)... I need not clarify.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: That is because the hon. Home Minister began by saying that he would talk only about Delhi. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI SHIVRAJ V. PATIL: Sir, I hope that I will be allowed to speak. I request all that I should be heard. You have said during the course of the discussion that this is about Delhi and you have also said that some references were made to Kerala also. You have allowed them and that means that the entire debate is to be replied to. I have no difficulty in doing that. But then, let them hear me out first.

Sir, I am giving this information because the hon. Members from this, that and the other sides have given certain suggestions to the Home Ministry and the Home Minister and they have asked certain questions. It is my duty to reply to those questions and it is only with that intention that I am giving you this information. At 10.45 A.M., at the Hindu Mahasabha Bhavan, 200 people had gathered without permission to gather. Now, when this came to the notice of the SHO of the Mandir Marg Police Station, two companies were sent to that place and also, one more platoon were sent to that place, beause the permission was not obtained and nearly 200 people had gathered there. Hence, this precaution was taken. Now hon. Members had asked what was done and so, I am giving you this information. At A.K. Gopalan Bhavan, Bhai Veer Singh Marg, around that time, nearly 30 or 40 persons came in their cars from deifferent directions. Later on, this mob increased in size and there were nearly

150 persons at that place. Now, when this was noticed by the Police, two platoons were sent to those places. And then one company of police persons were sent there. Now, there also, people had collected without any information to the Police without obtaining any permission. Now, the people who had collected near A.K. Gopalan Bhawan started pelting stones on this building. ...(*Interruptions*)...

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज: यह गलत है। ...(**व्यवधान**)...

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: This is a wrong statement. ...(*Interruptions*)...There is a CD with the media. They have recorded everything. ...(*Interruptions*)... Everybody has seen it. ...(*Interruptions*)... It is a wrong statement. ...(*Interruptions*)... It is a wrong statement. ...(*Interruptions*)...

श्री उपसभापति: बोलने दीजिए, होम मिनिस्टर साहब को। ...(**व्यवधान**)... मिस्टर अहलुवालिया जी,यह क्या तरीका है? ...(**व्यवधान**)... यह क्या तरीका है? ...(**व्यवधान**)... उन्होंने रिक्वेस्ट की कि he should be heard, and you agreed. ...(*Interruptions*)...

जो बात आपको अच्छी लगती है, क्या आप वही सुनेंगे? ...(**व्यवधान**)... नहीं, नहीं। गलत नहीं। ...(**व्यवधान**)... होम मिनिस्टर जवाब दे रहे हैं रेस्पोन्सिबिलिटी से दे रहे हैं। ...(**व्यवधान**)...

SHRI SHIVRAJ V. PATIL: You are fielding in the area of breach of privilege. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: Try to understand what I said. ...(*Interruptions*)... If you have seen the recordings on televisions, then ...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Ahluwalia, there is a limit for this. ...(*Interruptions*)...What is this? The hon. Home Minister, with all responsibility, is replying to the debate and you are challenging him without allowing him to speak.

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: How can he speak like this? ...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: He has got information. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: We have seen the live telecast ...(*Interruptions*)... We have seen the telecast. ...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Why are you interrupting the proceedings? ...(*Interruptions*)... Whatever you have to say, you have said.

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: You compare it with CD to know what is true or wrong. ...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Why to take CD and check? ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI SHIVRAJ V. PATIL: I am expected to collect this information from the Police which is working under me and give this information to you and I have collected this information from the Police and giving this information to you. If this information is wrong, I can take action against them. But if this information is correct and if you are insinuating anything, action I would ask this House to take against him also.

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: Don't challenge. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI ARUN JAITLEY: We have a serious doubt. I have a point of order. We are debating a serious issue. Some incidents have taken place in Kerala and some incidents have taken

place in Delhi. We expect the Central Government and the Home Minister to come out with a fair reply. But the tone and tenor of his indicates that he does not ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You are a senior parliamentarian. He has been replying to the debate ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI ARUN JAITLEY: He cannot challenge a Member.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: When he said that ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI ARUN JAITLEY: The Home Minister cannot tell a Member that ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SHIVRAJ V. PATIL: If the hon. Member says that I am responsible for getting that FIR registered, then what will I do? ...*(Interruptions)*... Did I say that you are responsible? ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: He is in the Government; he is giving reply. ...*(Interruptions)*... This is not a Question Hour in which you put the question and reply is given. We have accepted this Zero Hour mention and the Government agreed to it. Otherwise, Zero Hour questions, Government need to reply. It is by agreement that the Home Minister agreed to respond. Now, if you are interested, the Chair cannot direct the Government to give reply according to it. And, if you are not pleased with the reply, I cannot say and I cannot decide what is right, whether he is making a true statement or not. But, he is the Home Minister of the country. I believe whatever statement he is making is correct unless it is proved otherwise. It is the law.

SHRI SHIVRAJ V. PATIL: Sir, I was giving information to this hon. House as to what number of policemen and officers were deployed because that was the question asked by a Member siting on this side also and a question was asked by the hon. Member also who initiated this debate. So, I am giving the information and here, I am telling what has been informed to me. I was not there in the police station sitting and watching all those things. I have to rely on my Police officers, and why should I disbelieve what they say unless it is proved otherwise? If it is proved otherwise, we are free to take action against them. But, if it is correct, it is my duty to defend them also ...*(Interruptions)*... When the stones were pelted, two teargas shells had to be used there. When, this was done, ultimately, after nearly 45 minutes or one hour, the mob dispersed. Now, what happened when the stones were pelted? How many people were injured? I would like to give that information to the House. Ten CPI(M) members were injured. They were in the building. Eight policemen were injured. They were on the road. Three BJP members were injured. They were on the road, and other three persons were injured and three cars also got damaged which were there. Now, this is exactly what had happened there. After that information was received by the Police Station, the SHO gave the information and one member of the party also gave that information.

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: I personally gave the information.

SHRI SHIVRAJ V. PATIL: Then, it was registered. What happened afterwards? After that information was registered, fourteen persons were arrested. There were six Councillors among the fourteen persons arrested. There were others also against whom this complaint had been filed. The names are there. I am not going to disclose their names. It is not necessary for understanding what had actually happened there. Names of so many persons were given, and then, at about 4.30 in the afternoon, one FIR was filed by the BJP. The incident started

at 10.30. It continued for one hour, and then, information report was given, FIR was registered, persons were arrested, and then, at 4.30 p.m., another FIR, by BJP, was registered. I was asked by the hon. Members that the Home Minister should see that FIR is registered. Now, if I do that, I would have committed a mistake. I would have gone against the law. The Home Minister is not responsible for registering the FIR; not even the DG sitting there is responsible. It is the Police Station officer who does it, and if I say that register it or don't register it, I am responsible. On the one hand, an allegation was made that at Government's instance, it was done, and on the other, a mention was made that the other FIR should be registered. We are not taking any stand on this. We are saying that if an FIR is there, if registerable, it will be registered. If it is not registerable, it will not be registered. There is a procedure laid down for this purpose. The Criminal Procedure Code will be the guiding principle. These are not the executive orders, these are not the rules, this is the law made by this Parliament and the law made by the Parliament is final. Now, this is the status as far as this situation is concerned.

A question was asked as to what happened in Kerala. Sir, my information is that some persons were killed in Kerala. Now, on the question as to how many persons were killed in Kerala, I am told that two CPM members were killed, and, I am told that five RSS members were killed. Now you are asking me as to what is the information with regard to the incident that happened in Delhi. I am not in a position to go there, see, and, then, give you the information. You are asking me to comment on what happened in Kerala; I am giving you the information that has been given to me.

When this incident was brought to the notice of the Government of India, naturally, the Government of India collected the information from the Kerala Government as to what had actually happened, what were the number of casualties, why had it happened and what steps had been taken by the Government of Kerala in order to control that. The Government of Kerala informed that all steps have been taken to maintain law and order. One hundred and fifteen persons have been taken into preventive custody in Kerala. Adequate policing deployment has been done. Ten companies of armed personnel, four SPs, thirteen Dy. SPs and twelve Circle Inspectors of Police are deployed. Prohibitory orders under Police Act in eight police station limits have been imposed. Peace Committee meeting have been convened, which are attended by representatives of affected political parties. Now, leaders of these parties have given assurance that they would refrain their workers from indulging in violence. Incidents occurred due to political rivalry. Situation in the area is now normal.

Now, this is the information that I have got. If you want the detailed information about it, I cannot concoct the information and give it to the House. I shall have to collect it from the police and then give that to you. Now, if you get the notice admitted, definitely, it will be my bounden duty to get the information and give it to you. I am following the law, which is laid down and the Rules are given here. This city of Delhi, being a Union Territory, is under the Government of India, and, I am expected to reply to that debate. That is why, I have collected the information from my officers, and, I am giving this information to you. I am neither depending on what has happened in the media, nor depending on what has been told to me, nor on any allegations made and all those things.

I am saying that this is the information given to me. I am saying that certainly the law will take its own course. I am not saying that this man belongs to this party or that party. I am saying that anybody who has committed a crime will be proceeded against for proper action. This is exactly what the hon. Members, in this House, have asked the Home Ministry, the Home Minister and the officers working under the Home Ministry to do and this is exactly what I will do.

With this kind of pronouncement made by the hon. Members in the House to take stern action against those people who have committed offence, Sir, you should rest assured that this will be done. This will be done.

Sir, we are having lot many difficulties. We are facing difficulties because of violence on the basis of religion. We are facing difficulties because of the cultural, tribal attitudes visible at some places, and, because of the economic issue also. Now, this is something else where 'political violence' is also being created. Sir, every time, a debate takes place, all in one voice, 'tell the Home Ministry and the officers in the Home Ministry that they should be strict and they should taken action. You can rest assured, Sir, with your backing, with your sanction, with your approval, this shall be done. This will be done, I can tell this House. But, later on, please, don't attribute any motives to us, if we take action against one party or the other party. If I don't take action against one party, I am a good man. If I take action against one member of a party, I am a bad man. That cannot happen. The police and the Ministry have to face this type of difficulty. They will definitely have to face this type of difficulty. But, I do think that the political vandalism, political violence will create a lot of difficulties for the system we are following here, for the democracy we are following here. And, if anybody is thinking that they would be able to do this, with cudgels in their hands, with stones in their hands, with guns in their hands or by using strong language or intemperate language or accusing with reason or with reason' anyone else they would be able to achieve anything, probably this country is not in that condition. Now, it is not the responsibility of the Government of India to go to one State or the other State. In many States where different political parties are ruling, these things have happened. We are not exposing them on the floor of this House. But, if this is happening, we are giving them the directions that this should not happen, any State for that matter. And, may I tell you if I give the names of the States, you will feel very uneasy because none of these States are free from this. Something has happened somewhere. And yet, in a responsible manner, we have told them. And now that you are saying that these kinds of activities and violence should not be allowed, I think, we are reinforced in our desire and determination to do our duty to see that violence is not used for political purpose in any manner.

[THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN) in the Chair]

It did not help in Europe. It will not help in India. Nowhere it will help. Now, this kind of using violence will not help and it will not be allowed even if it is done by one party or the other.

This is my explanation.

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, I have a clarification.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Let him ask first. After he, you will be given an opportunity. He asked first.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, we are not asking the Home Minister to do this or not to do this, register this FIR or that FIR. The issue is, an incident has happened. There were allegations on both sides. The police is expected to act independently. That has not happened. One can ask, let the Home Minister view the television channels which have shown that stones were pelted on the demonstrators from the top of the building. If he ... *(Interruptions)*...

रेल मंत्री (श्री लालू प्रसाद): आप क्या बात करते हैं?

श्री एम॰ वेंकेया नायडु: क्या बात करते हैं, जो बात है, वही बात करेंगे, न...(**व्यवधान**)..

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Please ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir ...*(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): You will get a chance. I will give you a chance. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री एम॰ वेंकेया नायडु: मैं किसी के बारे में आरोप नहीं लगा रहा हूं। मंत्री लोग यहां बैठ कर ऐसा comment करें, इसका परिणाम क्या होगा, यह आपको भी मालूम होगा। Sir, the Home Minister gave a very, what you call, noble speech. He should have advised his party Members not to provoke others and go to the extent of (*Interruptions*)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Please, please ...*(Interruptions)*... You were asking a clarification.

SHRI VENKAIAH NAIDU: It is this mentality which should not be allowed, which should be crushed. ...*(Interruptions)*... This is what we are saying from the beginnning. ...*(Interruptions)*... Sir, coming back to the point, my point is that the Delhi Police, for whatever reasons, I am not going into the details, I don't want to make comments ...*(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Don't make a speech. Ask clarification.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir,. my clarification is that the Delhi Police acted on the political pressure. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री लालू प्रसाद: यह आपके राज में होता था।

श्री एम॰ वेंकेया नायडु: आपको भी मालूम है कि जय प्रकाश के राज में ऐसा ही होता था।...(**व्यवधान**)... Sir, will the Home Minister, in view of this debate and the new fact coming to light, get the other version and also view the television channels which have openly shown that stones were pelted on the demonstrators and also take action against the people who were responsible for that? This is number one, Sir. Number two, with regard to the political violence and the murderous attacks that are taking place, it is not the question of numbers, I am not justifying two people from the CPM or five people from the RSS and our number is more. Sir, the issue is not that. It is that the ruling party, its own Home Minister, his own area ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री लालू प्रसाद: होम मिनिस्टर से क्यों नहीं मिले?

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Please, please. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, in that area, a series of clashes are taking place, attacks are taking place. I have been to that State.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Please, please. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री लालू प्रसाद: दफ्तर में क्यों गए?

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: There you can see it in the reports in the newspapers. *(Interruptions)* People are driven out of the villages. Why we are requesting the Union Home Minister is because the system has failed.

श्री लालू प्रसाद: दफ्तर में क्यों गए?...(**व्यवधान**)...आप जाकर होम मिनिस्टर से हाथ जोड़कर बोलते। ...(**व्यवधान**)...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, the people are made to leave their houses. *(Interruptions)* People are attacked in the examination hall. I mentioned the incident, giving the name of the person also. *(Interruptions)*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): No, no. You sit down. *(Interruptions)* Don't be impatient. *(Interruptions)* Please, you conclude. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI A. VIJAYARAGHAVAN: Sir, what is the clarification? He is making allegations.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Sit down. I will decide. *(Interruptions)*

श्री लालू प्रसाद: दफ्तर क्यों गए? सी.पी.एम. दफ्तर जाते...(**व्यवधान**)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMEN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Venkaiah Naiduji, you please conclude. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, my point is that the student who was there in the examination hall is now in the hospital. *(Interruptions)*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): You ask the question and conclude. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Can you say that it is your stand that it is a State issue and you are not going to discuss it at all? *(Interruptions)*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): You ask the question and conclude.

श्री एम॰ वेंकैया नायडु: सर, बुक में भी है, आपको भी मालूम है, I don't want to take it to personal level. In Kerala, it is everybody's knowledge, all non-CPM parties are casualties one day or the other and we are also going to become casualty. So, coming back to my point, I would like to request and know from the hon. Home Minister whether he is willing to get an independent report from the State with regard to forcible eviction of the opponents from different villages of that particular district and particularly Thalassery and nearby areas.

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, first of all, before I come to the clarification, please grant me permission to clear the point that stones were being pelted from the CPM office side. Sir, CPM office is an office of a national party. We don't put stones and collect them in our office, waiting for the RSS to come so that we can throw stones on them. Sir, what an absurd charge is this! This sort of thing can't be allowed. *(Interruptions)*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Please don't interrupt. I allowed you to make your point and you had your share. Now, you please listen. *(Interruptions)* No, no, you have to listen. *(Time-bell)* One second. Now, you have to listen. They heard you patiently and allowed you to speak. Now, you have to listen.

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: So, Sir, that is an absurd charge. The hon. Home Minister has given us the facts on the basis of what the police has reported to him and on that basis, the Government should act. That is one point. But, Sir, regarding Kerala, since the discussion has come up, we can discuss it separately if the Chair permits. We can have a discussion. But, let me also tell this House that yesterday, the hon. Home Minister of Kerala waited the whole day for the RSS to come and have talks with him and they did not show up. If they are interested in peace, why don't they go for talks?

श्री लालू प्रसाद: आफिस क्यों गए थे?

*Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: They did not go for talks for the whole day.

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA:*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): No, no. One second. That sentence is expunged. You can't say that.

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, as far as this particular issue is concerned, the notice was.*(Interruptions)*....

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Please don't interrupt. We want to adjourn for lunch.*(Interruptions)*

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, the issue was the attack on the CPM headquarters at Delhi and in that attack, ten of our people were grievously injured. That has been mentioned by the hon. Minister. Sir, I am only asking from the hon. Home Minister.*(Interruptions)*

श्री दिग्विजय सिंह: कोई धरना न दे, कोई...(**व्यवधान**)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Please, please.*(Interruptions)*

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: He very rightly said that political violence is something that has to be abjured, that is something that this domocratic system cannot tolerate. Sir, in the beginning itself, I had asked this House to adopt a resolution saying that this is condemnable and this sort of political violence should not take place. And, I think, everybody has agreed and let the spirit be conveyed from this House.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Thank you. *(interruptions)*... No, no.

श्री दिग्विजय सिंह: उपसभाध्यक्ष, जी, मैं एक शब्द बोलना चाहता हूं।...(**व्यवधान**)...मैंने कुछ नहीं बोला है। सब पोलिटिकल पार्टियां बोली हैं, हमने कुछ नहीं कहा है।...(**व्यवधान**)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): One sentence only.

श्री दिग्विजय सिंह: मैं एक लाइन बोलूंगा। मैं चाहूंगा कि इस सदन में हम सब समझदार लोग बैठे हैं। हम लोग यह तय करें कि सरकार के खिलाफ तो प्रदर्शन हो, लेकिन पोलिटिकल पार्टी के दफ्तर पर प्रदर्शन करना हम लोग बन्द करें।

कुछ माननीय सदस्य: बिलकुल ठीक है।

श्री दिग्विजय सिंह: क्यों करें हम लोग यह सब?...(**व्यवधान**)...

श्री लालू प्रसाद: ठीक है।

श्री दिग्विजय सिंह: यह हम लोग तय करें। क्यों होम मिनिस्टर को घेरा जाए?...(**व्यवधान**)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Now, Mr. Home Minister please.*(Interruptions)* Sit down. *(Interruptions)* Now, nobody else, only the hon. Home Minister.*(Interruptions)*

SHRI SHIVRAJ V. PATIL: Sir, I can understand the query made by Mr. Venkaiah Naidu that if anybody has suffered in Kerala, he should be given relief, help, and the matter should be redressed and rectified. I can understand that. But it is not possible for the Government of India to start an independent inquiry over there. Now, if I start doing it in Kerala. I will be doing it in many other States. Then, I would also be asked. Why are you doing this? Have you forgotten the federal provisions of the Constitution? How is it allowed? But I can assure you that we would definitely have discussions with the Government of Kerala in order to see

that the peace and order is maintained and nobody is put in difficulty. And I have no doubt in my mind; the Kerala Government will cooperate with the Government of India and will understand the feelings which you have expressed on the floor of the House. I feel it in my bones that that would happen. So, I can do that much.

As far as the second suggestion given by Mr. Yechury is concerned, now, he is not insisting that a resolution should be passed. But, very rightly, he is saying that the feeling expressed is that the violence in political matters should be abjured, and this is, I think, something on which there cannot be any objection. Now, this is the message which is going out, whether we pass it formally that this is the view of the House, or whether, informally, we agree on this that political violence is not going to help anybody. And definitely, this message will go out, Sir. I have no doubt.

Now, the third suggestion is this. Sir, very, very ingeniously, it is mentioned: Why do you go to the political party? Why don't you go to the Prime minister's office or the Home minister's office, or to start it from our houses? Now, this is a very, very tricky suggestion given by Mr. Shourie. ...*(Interruptions)*... If anything happens, let it happen in front of their houses, not here, our houses.....*(Interruptions)*... we are serious enough....*(Interruptions)*... we are serious enough....*(Interruptions)*

SHRI TARIQ ANWAR: Your house is very much protected!

SHRI SHIVRAJ V. PATIL: We are serious enough to see through this thing and I would ask, don't use your wisdom or ingenuity for these purposes. Let it not happen anywhere. If there is any difficulty, we are all willing to talk to each other and discuss it. This kind of thing is not required. Thank you , Sir.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): The House is adjourned for one hour. It will meet at 3.38 p.m.

The House then adjourned at thirty-eight minutes past two of the clock.

The House reassembled after lunch at thirty-nine minutes past three of the clock,

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN) IN THE Chair.

THE VICE CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J.KURIEN): The Discussion on the Budget (Railways), 2008-09.*(Interruptions)*

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: Sir, we are going to take up the Budget (Railways) now. But the Cabinet Minister is not present here. Where is the Minister who moved the Railway Budget? Where is he? *(interruptions)*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): I will deal with him. Please sit down.

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: Sir, the point is very simple. The person who moves a motion. The person who places the Budget, should be present in the House at the time of starting the debate.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): You have made your point. Now take your seat. See, the Cabinet is a collective responsibility. The Minister of State is here. That is enough.

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: In this case, no .*(Interruptions)*. In this case, no. the collective responsibility cannot be put....*(Interruptions)*.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): You have made your point and I have given my ruling. Now, take your seat .*(Interruptions)*

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: Sir, I am not challenging your ruling. But it will give a wrong message.*(Interruptions)*. It is a very big budget and the Cabinet Minister is not present. Why? *(Interruptions)*.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN ((PROF. P.J. KURIEN): You take your seat. *(Interruptions)*.

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: If he is sick, we can accommodate. If he is out of town, we can accommodate. But he is very much there.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Please take your seat. The Minister of State is here.

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: Sir, this is not fair.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): I have given the ruling.

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: Sir, you are not only presiding the House, you are also a very seasoned Parliamentarian. Tell me a single instance when the Mover of the Motion; when the Mover of the Budget, was absent at the time of initiating the debate.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: The Minister of State is here. He will take note of the points.*(Interruptions)*.

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: What is this? How can you do this?

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF.P.J. KURIEN): You have made your point. That is all. I have given the ruling.

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: Sir, I am requesting you to direct the Government to call the Railway Minister. Till the Railway Minister comes, you adjourn the House.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: Sir, the debate is going on in the Lok Sabha also. He cannot be present in both the Houses.

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA: Sir, can we start a debate?.... *(Interruptions)*.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P. J. KURIEN): Please sit down. The Minister of State has to say something.

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF RAILWAYS (SHRI R. VELU): Sir, first of all, let me clarify the matter. He is a very senior Member of this House. The Cabinet Minister includes the Minister of State.....(*Interruptions)*.

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: Have you presented the Budget?

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P. J. KURIEN): Mr. Minister, you tell us why the Railway Minister has not come. *(Interruptions)*. Mr. Ahluwalia, let him say that. You allow him to have his say. Please allow him. Mr. Minister, you tell what inconvenience has caused to the Railway Minister. Why hasn't he come?

SHRI R. VELU: The hon. Minister is present in the Lok Sabha where the discussion is going on.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P. J. KURIEN): That is enough. That is all. Shrimati Sushma Swaraj. *(Interruptions).*

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: No. At the time of starting the Railway Budget in Lok Sabha, he was present there. *(Interruptions).* It is an insult to the House. *(Interruptions).* How can you allow that?

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P. J. KURIEN): You have made your say. He has given the reply and I have given my ruling. What else do you want?

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: I am not satisfied.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P. J. KURIEN): Let him speak.

THE BUDGET (RAILWAYS) 2008-09
GENERAL DISCUSSION

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज (मध्य प्रदेश): उपसभाध्यक्ष महोदय, संसद की कुछ परंपराएं, संसदीय गरिमा के नाम पर जानी जाती हैं। वे पार्लियामेंट्री प्रोप्राइटीज कहलाती हैं। यह भी एक प्रोप्राइटी है कि दोनों सदनों में जब बजट, रेल बजट या राष्ट्रपति अभिभाषण पर चर्चा प्रारंभ होती है, तो राष्ट्रपति अभिभाषण के समय स्वयं प्रधान मंत्री और बजट और रेल बजट के समय वित्त मंत्री और रेल मंत्री उपस्थित रहते हैं। रेल मंत्री जी यह तर्क दें कि लोक सभा में बहस चल रही है। तो शायद समझ में आ जाए, लेकिन हमारे अपने हाउस की रूलिंग पार्टी के चीफ विप्प, जो स्वयं राज्य सभा के सदस्य हैं, वे यह तर्क दें, तो बात समझ से परे है। अगर दोनों सदनों में चर्चा चल रही है, तो मिनिस्टर ऑफ स्टेट लोक सभा में रह सकते हैं। क्योंकि वहां चर्चा दो दिन पहले प्रारंभ हो चुकी है, वहां साधारण रूप से चर्चा चल रही है, यहां चर्चा की शुरूआत हो रही है। चर्चा की शुरूआत में यहां रेल मंत्री रहते और श्री वेलू जी उतने समय लोक सभा में रह लेते तो कोई फ़र्क़ नहीं पड़ सकता था। लेकिन शायद कुछ परंपराएं हैं, सरकार ने तय किया है कि उनका निर्वहन नहीं करना है तो मुझे कुछ ज्यादा नहीं कहना है। मैं लालू जी को बधाई देकर अपनी बात शुरू करना चाहती थी, परंतु वे बधाई लेने के लिए यहां उपस्थित नहीं हैं, तो नुकसान उनका है। The loss is his, not mine. जिस तरह से उन्होंने रेल मंत्रालय संभाला है, तब से कभी आई॰आई॰एम॰ (अहमदाबाद) के छात्र उनसे वित्त प्रबंधन का प्रशिक्षण लेने आते हैं, कभी हार्वर्ड विश्वविद्यालय से उन्हें लेक्चर देने के लिए बुलाया जाता है। लालू जी से मेरा बहुत पुराना संबंध हैं वे मेरे स्नेही भाई हैं और मैं उनकी प्यारी बहिन हूं। मेरा माथा गर्व से ऊंचा होता है कि भारत के एक मंत्री ने अमरीका जैसे मुल्क से अपना लोहा मनवा लिया। लेकिन उपसभाध्यक्ष जी, यह वरदान भी शायद बहनों को ही मिला है कि उनके भाई कितने ही चतुर सुजान क्यों न हों,बहनें उनकी चतुराई भाँप लेती हैं। शायद आपको भी घर में यह अनुभव हुआ होगा। लड़के मां-बाप को चकमा दे जाते हैं, छोटे भाइयों को भी मूर्ख बनाने में कामयाब हो जाते हैं, लेकिन बहनों की आँख से उनकी कोई हरकत छिपी नहीं रहती है। वह उनकी हर कारीगरी जानती है और समय-समय पर उसे उगल भी देती है। उसी ईश्वरीय वरदान के तहत, जब मैं इस बजट भाषण को पढ़ रही थी तो लालू भई की एक -एक चतुराई मेरे सामने खुल-खुल कर सामने आती जा रही थी। फिर मैंने उनके पुराने चार के चार बजट भाषण मंगाकर पढ़े तो सभी कुछ मेरे सामने शीशे की तरह स्पष्ट हो गया।

उपसभाध्यक्ष जी, रेल मंत्री ने रेल के कायाकल्प को इस भाषण में जादुई कायाकल्प कहा है। अगर आप इनके बजट भाषण का पैरा 62 ओर 63 देखें तो उन्होंने कहा कि मैंने रेलवे का जादुई कायाकल्प किया है और उनकी स्पीच का जो दूसरा भाग है, उसमें तो उन्होंने एक दोहा ही पढ़ दिया है। उन्होंने कहा है - ''जादू-टोना हमने दिखाया था पिछले साल, इस बार पूरा इंद्रजाल देख लीजिए।'' जादू की यह खासियत होती है कि उसनें जो दिखता है, वह वास्तव में घटता नहीं है। मुझे बचपन की एक घटना याद आई। हमारे शहर अंबाला में एक जादूगर खेल दिखाने आया था। उसने डुगडुगी पिटवाई कि मैं मैदान में खेल दिखाने आऊंगा। सारे मोहल्ले के बच्चे खेल देखने जा रहे थे, मैं भी अपने भाई के साथ चली गई। उसने कई तरह के खेल दिखाए। उसके बाद उसने एक चादर बिछा दी और जोर से बोला - जय काली कलकत्ते वाली, तेरा वचन न जाए खाली, छू मंतर और पूरी चादर पर नोट ही नोट बिखर गए। एक-दो और खेल